

Use of Carnobacterium spp protective culture in MAP packed Ricotta fresca cheese to control Pseudomonas spp

Questa è la versione Post print del seguente articolo:

Original

Use of Carnobacterium spp protective culture in MAP packed Ricotta fresca cheese to control Pseudomonas spp / Spanu, C.; Piras, F.; Mocci, Anna Maria; Nieddu, G.; De Santis, E. P. L.; Scarano, C.. - In: FOOD MICROBIOLOGY. - ISSN 0740-0020. - 74:(2018), pp. 50-56. [10.1016/j.fm.2018.02.020]

Availability:

This version is available at: 11388/203301 since: 2022-05-27T11:08:27Z

Publisher:

Published

DOI:10.1016/j.fm.2018.02.020

Terms of use:

Chiunque può accedere liberamente al full text dei lavori resi disponibili come "Open Access".

Publisher copyright

note finali coverpage

(Article begins on next page)

Highlights

- *Pseudomonas* spp is the main spoilage microorganism in refrigerated ricotta fresca
- A microbiological challenge test was conducted on MAP ricotta fresca samples
- Carnobacterium spp commercial protective culture was tested against *Pseudomonas* spp
- Inoculation of Carnobacterium spp protective culture reduced *Pseudomonas* spp growth

1
2
3 1 **Use of *Carnobacterium* spp protective culture in MAP packed Ricotta *fresca* cheese to control**
4
5 2 ***Pseudomonas* spp**

6
7
8 3 C. Spanu¹, F. Piras¹, Anna Maria Mocci¹, G. Nieddu², E. P. L. De Santis*¹, C. Scarano¹

9
10 4 ¹*Department of Veterinary Medicine, University of Sassari, Via Vienna 2, 07100, Sassari, Italy*

11
12 5 ²*Cooperativa Allevatori Ovini Formaggi Soc. Coop. Agricola, Loc. "Perda Lada" Fenosu, 09170,*
13
14 6 *Oristano, Italy*

15
16 7 *Corresponding author. Tel.: +39 079 229447; fax.: +39 079 229458. E-Mail address:
17
18 8 desantis@uniss.it (E.P.L. De Santis); Via Vienna 2, 07100, Sassari, Italy.

19
20 9
21
22 10 **Abstract**

23
24 11 Ricotta *fresca* is a whey cheese susceptible of secondary contamination, mainly from *Pseudomonas*
25
26 12 spp. The extension of the shelf life of refrigerated *ricotta fresca* could be obtained using protective
27
28 13 cultures inhibiting the growth of this spoilage microorganism. A commercial biopreservative,
29
30 14 Lyofast CNBAL, comprising *Carnobacterium* spp was tested against *Pseudomonas* spp. The
31
32 15 surface of *ricotta fresca* samples were inoculated either with *Pseudomonas* spp or *Pseudomonas*
33
34 16 and *Carnobacterium* spp. Samples were MAP packed, stored at 4°C and analyzed the day of the
35
36 17 inoculum and 7, 14 and 21 days after the contamination. Microbiological analyses included total
37
38 18 bacterial count, mesophilic lactic acid bacteria, *Enterobacteriaceae*, *Pseudomonas* spp, *Listeria*
39
40 19 *monocytogenes*, moulds and yeasts. *Pseudomonas* mean initial contamination level was comparable
41
42 20 in blank and artificially inoculated samples, respectively with values of 2.15±0.21 and 2.34±0.26
43
44 21 log cfu g⁻¹. *Carnobacterium* spp. significantly reduced the growth of *Pseudomonas* spp respectively
45
46 22 of 1.28 log and 0.83 log after 14 and 21 days of refrigerated storage. Intrinsic properties and
47
48 23 physico-chemical composition were also investigated. Limited variation of pH was observed in
49
50 24 samples inoculated with the protective cultures, indicating low acidification properties of
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59

60
61
62 25 *Carnobacterium* spp. Instead, no significant differences were observed for a_w , moisture, fat and
63
64 26 proteins during storage and between inoculated and control samples.
65
66
67 27

68
69 28 Keywords: *Carnobacterium* spp.; protective cultures; *Pseudomonas* spp; ricotta; MAP.
70
71 29

72 73 30 **1. Introduction**

74
75 31 According to the Codex Standard for whey cheeses, these are solid, semi-solid, or soft products,
76
77 32 which are principally obtained through either the concentration of whey or the coagulation of whey
78
79 33 by heat with or without the addition of acid (Codex Alimentarius Codex Standard 284-1971). Whey
80
81 34 cheeses are manufactured all over the world at artisanal and industrial level using different
82
83
84 35 protocols depending on the country of origin. Ricotta, originally from Italy is the most renowned
85
86 36 whey cheese in the world (Pintado & Malcata, 2000). However, in European countries, especially in
87
88 37 the Mediterranean basin, wide varieties of whey cheeses are manufactured, mainly from ovine
89
90 38 whey. These whey cheeses fall under several designation, e.g. Anthotyros (Greece), Anari (Cyprus),
91
92 39 Requesón (Spain), Requeijao (Portugal), Broccio (France), Urdă (Balkans region). Ricotta *fresca* is
93
94 40 a traditional whey cheese, which in Sardinia is produced by heat coagulation of sheep's milk whey
95
96 41 remaining after the production of *Pecorino* type cheeses. The discontinuous manufacturing method
97
98 42 include whey heating into open kettles to 80-82 °C. At this temperature the flocculated proteins rise
99
100 43 and float on the surface. The curd is then scooped and transferred into perforated plastic baskets.
101
102
103 44 Ricotta baskets are allowed to drain and to cool into a cold room. The detailed manufacturing
104
105 45 process of Ricotta *fresca* has been previously described (Pala et al., 2016). Ricotta *fresca* is packed
106
107 46 either in food wrapping paper or in polypropylene trays that are heat sealed with plastic lidding
108
109 47 film. Depending on the food business operator, atmospheric air or modified atmosphere packaging
110
111 48 (MAP) is used. MAP conditions largely vary from one operator to another; with 30% CO₂ and 70%
112
113 49 N₂ being the most used gas mixture used. The shelf life is designated under the responsibility of the
114
115
116
117
118

119
120
121 50 food business operator and varies from 5-7 days for wrapped Ricotta up to 21 days for MAP
122
123 51 Ricotta. *Ricotta fresca* is poor in natural microflora since it is drastically reduced by the high
124
125 52 temperature applied during the thermal denaturation of whey proteins (Pintado, Macedo & Malcata,
126
127
128 53 2001). *Ricotta fresca* is exposed to post-process contamination originating from the cheese-making
129
130 54 environment, particularly in the steps between molding and packaging (Greenwood, Roberts &
131
132 55 Burden, 1991; Ibba et al., 2013). Given the high moisture (70-80%), elevated pH (6.10-6.80) and
133
134 56 the water activity (0.974-0.991) and the refrigerated storage (De Santis, Mazzette, Scintu, Deriu, &
135
136 57 Carta, 1999), *Ricotta fresca* is an excellent substrate for the possible growth of several psychotropic
137
138 58 pathogenic and spoilage microorganisms (De Santis & Mazzette, 2002). Common contaminants of
139
140 59 Ricotta fresca include *Pseudomonas* spp., *Enterobacteriaceae*, *Listeria monocytogenes*, *B. cereus*
141
142 60 and *Arcobacter* spp., yeast and moulds (Pintado, Macedo & Malcata, 2001; De Santis and Mazzette,
143
144 61 2002; De Santis et al. 2008; Ibba et al., 2013; Scarano et al.; 2014; Spanu et al., 2016; Tirloni et al.,
145
146 62 2017). However, *Pseudomonas* spp. benefits of the selective advantage of the combination of low
147
148 63 temperature and long storage to overgrow other microorganisms, reducing the risk of pathogens
149
150 64 growth (Buchanan & Bagi, 1999; Carrascosa et al., 2015). Therefore, *Pseudomonas* spp. represents
151
152 65 the main obstacle to extend *Ricotta fresca* shelf life (Pala et al., 2016). Growth of *Pseudomonas*
153
154 66 spp. to level as high as $7 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ negatively affect the sensory properties of the product
155
156 67 (Leriche et al., 2004). Important discoloration of the product derives by the secretion of yellow-
157
158 68 green pyoverdin (Meyer et al., 2002) and of a blue pigment (Cantoni, Stella, Cozzi, Iacumin, &
159
160 69 Comi, 2003; Martin, Murphy, Ralyea, Wiedmann & Boor, 2011; Andreani et al., 2015) from some
161
162 70 *Pseudomonas* spp. In order to reduce the initial microbial load at production, it is essential the strict
163
164 71 application of good hygiene and good manufacturing procedures. A previous investigation,
165
166 72 conducted on Sardinian cheese-making plant manufacturing *Ricotta fresca*, showed that there is an
167
168 73 association between secondary contamination with *Pseudomonas* spp. and the level of
169
170 74 implementation of the food safety management system at plant level (Pala et al., 2016). There is the
171
172
173
174
175
176
177

178
179
180 75 need of additional strategies to control the growth of *Pseudomonas* spp., especially in industrial
181
182 76 MAP *Ricotta fresca*. The use of bio preservatives to extend the shelf life of whey cheeses has been
183
184
185 77 previously tested (Davies, Bevis, & Delves-Broughton, 1997; Samelis, Kakouri, Rogga, Savvaidis,
186
187 78 & Kontominas, 2003; Martins, Cerqueira, Souza, do Carmo Avides, & Vicente et al., 2010).
188
189 79 Carnobacteria are Gram positive rod shaped lactic acid bacteria (LAB) isolated from different
190
191 80 ecological niches. The genus *Carnobacterium*, is able to produce bacteriocins therefore, it has
192
193 81 been used as protective cultures to provide durability and safety to various types of foods (Elsser-
194
195 82 Gravesen & Elsser-Gravesen, 2013). Of the species included in the genus *Carnobacterium*, only
196
197 83 two, *C. divergens* and *C. maltaromaticum*, are frequently isolated from natural environment and
198
199 84 dairy products (Leisner, Laursen, Prevost, Drider, & Dalgaard, 2007; Afzal et al., 2010).
200
201 85 *Carnobacterium* spp, due to similar growth conditions (pH and temperature variation) of
202
203 86 psychrotrophic spoilage and pathogen microorganisms, can improve the durability of chilled foods
204
205 87 by reducing or inhibiting the growth of *Pseudomonas* spp. To date, little investigation has been
206
207 88 conducted to validate the efficacy of bio preservatives against *Pseudomonas* spp. in sheep *Ricotta*
208
209 89 *fresca* cheese. A commercial protective culture, consisting of a selected strain of *Carnobacterium*
210
211 90 spp producing bacteriocins, the Lyofast CNBAL (Clerici-Sacco Group, Como, Italy) was sprayed
212
213 91 on *Ricotta fresca* surface (Spanu et al., 2017). The study demonstrated a good adaptation to the
214
215 92 substrate with growth during refrigerated storage with no acidification of the product.
216
217 93 *Carnobacterium* spp. showed a competitive activity against *Pseudomonas* spp. in *Ricotta fresca*.
218
219 94 However, the experiment was conducted on naturally contaminated samples. The main objective of
220
221 95 the present study was to evaluate, as a possible innovation in the manufacturing process of *Ricotta*
222
223 96 *fresca*, the use of a protective culture to control the superficial contamination against spoilage
224
225 97 microorganisms. With this aim, the efficacy of *Carnobacterium* spp against the growth of
226
227 98 *Pseudomonas* spp was tested in artificially contaminated *Ricotta fresca*.
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236

237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295

100 2. Materials and methods

101 2.1. Samples

102 The study was conducted on 162 *Ricotta fresca* samples provided by a local industrial cheese-
103 making plant using the whey remaining after the production of hard sheep's milk cheese (e.g.
104 *Pecorino* type cheeses). The samples were truncated cone shaped cheese with an upper base ca. 7.5
105 cm wide and a lower base ca. 5 cm wide, weighing approximately 1.1 kg. Fifty-five *Ricotta fresca*
106 samples were randomly selected from each of three different batches (each batch was manufactured
107 in a different day of production). Samples were packed in MAP (gas mixture was 30% CO₂ and
108 70% N₂) using rigid polypropylene trays sealed with high-barrier peelable laminated films. Films
109 were made of bioriented polyamide and cast polypropylene with O₂ T.R. (20°- 65% R.H.) of ~30
110 cc/m², 24 h. After packaging samples were transported refrigerated to the laboratory within 24 from
111 the production. Within each batch, samples were randomly allocated to the following treatment:
112 artificial inoculation with *Pseudomonas fluorescens* (RfPf), artificial inoculation with *Pseudomonas*
113 *fluorescens* and *Carnobacterium* spp (RfPf+C), no treatment (RfB). Part of the samples (Ph-Ch)
114 were used for the determination of intrinsic properties (pH and a_w), percentage composition
115 (moisture, fat, protein) and headspace gas composition (CO₂ and O₂).

116 2.2 Artificial inoculation

117 The RfPf units (n. 36) were the units artificially inoculated with *Pseudomonas fluorescens*, which
118 served as positive control samples. The preparation of the inoculum was conducted according to the
119 guidelines prepared by NACMCF (2010). A mixture of five *Pseudomonas fluorescens* wild type
120 strains was used to challenge *Ricotta fresca* units. The strains were recovered from naturally
121 contaminated *Ricotta fresca* during a previous investigation (Pala et al., 2016). In order to avoid
122 overrepresentation of clones, isolates were submitted to genetic characterization using pulsed-field
123 gel electrophoresis (PFGE). Only strains with different restriction profile were included in the
124 preparation of the inoculum. All the strains were stored at -80 °C in Brain Heart Infusion (BHI)

296
297
298 125 broth (Oxoid, Basingstoke, UK) with glycerol (20% v/v). In order to account for natural
299
300 126 contamination levels and allow the enumeration of the inoculum, the target level was 10^2 cfu g⁻¹ of
301
302 product surface (Spanu et al., 2014). Preliminary trials were conducted in order to determine the
303 127
304 growth condition necessary to standardize the level of inoculum and to adapt strains to refrigeration
305 128
306 temperature. Each strains was subcultured by streaking onto the non selective trypticase soy agar
307 129
308 medium (TSA, Biolife, Milan, Italy) and incubated for 24 h at 25 °C. A single colony was picked
309 130
310 and transferred into tubes containing the non-selective brain heart infusion broth, BHI (Oxoid,
311 131
312 Basingstoke, UK). Tubes were incubated overnight at 25°C in a shaking water bath to obtain cells
313 132
314 in the same physiological state (late exponential or early stationary phase). Adaptation of the strains
315 133
316 to refrigeration was conducted by subculturing in BHI broth at 4±2 °C until cells were in the
317 134
318 exponential growth phase (Uyttendaele et al., 2004). Equal volumes of each individual culture were
319 135
320 mixed in a sterile flask. From the mixture were prepared adequate serial decimal dilution in
321 136
322 phosphate buffered saline (Biolife) to adjust the concentration to 10^4 cfu mL⁻¹. After the removal of
323 137
324 the sealing film, an aliquot of 1.5-2.0 mL of inoculum was evenly sprayed on the surface of Ricotta
325 138
326 fresca (ca. 290 cm², corresponding to ca. 40-50 g of product). All concentrations were confirmed
327 139
328 by plate count on TSA (Biolife).
329 140
330
331
332 141 After the inoculum of *Pseudomonas fluorescens*, the RfP+C units (n. 36) were also inoculated with
333 142
334 the protective cultures Lyofast CNBAL (Clerici-Sacco Group, Como, Italy) consisting of a selected
335 143
336 strain of *Carnobacterium* spp producing bacteriocins with an optimum growth temperature between
337 144
338 25-45 °C. The commercial formulation is a freeze-dried powder, which, according to
339 145
340 manufacturer's instructions, was diluted in Phosphate-buffered saline (PBS) solution (Oxoid) to
341 146
342 obtain 10^6 cfu g⁻¹ of product. With this aim, the suspension was adjusted to a concentration of 10^8
343 147
344 cfu mL⁻¹ and 1.5-2.0 mL were evenly sprayed on the *Ricotta fresca* surface. *Carnobacterium* spp
345 148
346 concentrations were confirmed by count on agar plates. After the inoculation, all samples (included
347 149
348 untreated blank samples) were repacked in MAP (30% CO₂ and 70% N₂) using the FP Basic Sec
349
350
351
352
353
354

355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413

tray sealer (Ilpra, Vigevano, Italy). Blank samples were packed under the same conditions of the other samples with no further manipulation. All samples were stored under refrigeration (+ 4°C) until analysis were performed.

2.3 Experimental design

Triplicate samples of each of the three batches of *Ricotta fresca* were analyzed the day of inoculation (T₀), and after different days of refrigerated storage, respectively 7 (T₇), 14 (T₁₄) and 21 (T₂₁). At each time-point RfPf, RfPf+C and RfB samples were analyzed for the determination of the microbiological profile. In order to mimic the evolution of the microbiological profile under the foreseeable condition during retail selling, a subset of RfPf+C samples were opened seven days after the inoculation and analyzed after three further days of storage (T₁₀) at 8±2°C (abuse temperature). *Ricotta fresca* samples were also analyzed for the determination of the intrinsic properties, composition and headspace gas analysis. The detailed design including sample units, testing times and related analysis is described in table 1.

2.3. Microbiological profile

Ricotta fresca samples submitted to microbiological examination were prepared according to ISO 6887-1:1999. Briefly, the initial suspension and decimal dilution was conducted after the sterile collection of to 25 g of ricotta surface into a sterile plastic stomacher bag. 225 mL of Buffered Peptone Water were added and the sample homogenized using a stomacher. Decimal serial dilutions were obtained by transferring 1 mL of the initial suspension into a tube containing 9 mL of sterile diluent. If required, these operations were repeated using the 10⁻² to obtain further serial decimal dilution. The pour-plating procedure was used for the enumeration of aerobic mesophilic bacteria, mesophilic lactic acid bacteria and *Enterobacteriaceae*, yeasts and moulds. Plate Count Agar and MRS medium at pH 5.7 (Biolife, Milan, Italy) were incubated at 30°C ± 1°C for 72 h ± 3 h respectively for the enumeration of aerobic mesophilic bacteria (ISO 4833:2003) and mesophilic lactic acid bacteria (ISO 15214: 1998). The enumeration of *Enterobacteriaceae* was conducted

414
415
416 175 using the plate count technique without resuscitation, incubating Violet Red Bile Agar plates
417
418 176 (Biolife) at 35-37°C for 24 h (ISO 21528-1:2004). Enumeration of yeast and molds was conducted
419
420
421 177 using Chloramphenicol Yeast Glucose Agar plates (Biolife) incubated at 25 ± 1°C up to 5 days
422
423 178 (ISO 6611/IDF094:2004). For the enumeration of *Pseudomonas* spp (ISO/TS 11059:2009), 0.1 mL
424
425 179 of each decimal dilution were spread over the surface of Pseudomonas Agar Plates added with PP
426
427 180 supplement (Biolife) and incubated at 25 °C ± 1°C for 48 h ± 2 h. For the detection of *Listeria*
428
429 181 *monocytogenes* (ISO 2004a) the initial suspension was supplemented with Fraser Half Selective
430
431 182 Supplement (Biolife) and incubated at 30 °C for 24 h (primary enrichment). After incubation 0.1
432
433 183 mL of the primary enrichment were subcultured into 10 mL of Fraser Broth and incubated at 37°C
434
435 184 for 24-48 h (enrichment). From both, pre-enrichment and enrichment broth, 0.1 mL were streaked
436
437
438 185 onto Agar Listeria Ottaviani Agosti (ALOA, Biolife) and Oxford (Oxoid, Basingstoke, UK) agar
439
440 186 plates and incubated at 37 °C for up to 48 ±3 h. Enumeration of *L. monocytogenes* (ISO 2004b)
441
442 187 was a conducted streaking 1 mL volume of the initial dilution onto both three ALOA and three
443
444 188 Oxford agar plates and incubated at 37 °C for up to 48 ±3 h. The enumeration of *Carnobacterium*
445
446 189 *spp* was conducted using MRS modified by increasing the pH to 8.5, omitting acetate, and
447
448 190 substituting glucose for sucrose (Hammes et al., 1992).
449

450 191 2.5. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* characterization

451

452 192 A total of five colonies from each sample containing typical colonies on Pseudomonas Agar Plates
453
454 193 were confirmed with two different PCR protocols, one used to identify *Pseudomonas fluorescens*
455
456
457 194 (Scarpellini et al., 2004) and the other to identify *Pseudomonas* spp and *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*
458
459 195 (De Vos et al., 1997). Among the confirmed *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strains, up to three isolates
460
461 196 per samples were randomly selected and analyzed using pulsed-field gel electrophoresis (PFGE).
462
463 197 After DNA extraction, agarose plugs were digested with enzyme restriction *SpeI* (Roche
464
465 198 Diagnostics,
466
467
468
469
470
471
472

473
474
475 199 Laval, Quebec, Canada) (Maslow, 1993). PFGE was performed using the protocol described by
476
477 200 (Gershman et al., 2008). The obtained restriction profiles were analyzed by visual examination to
478
479
480 201 distinguish inoculated strains among each other and from strains originating by natural
481
482 202 contamination.

483 484 203 *2.5. Intrinsic properties, composition and headspace gas analysis*

485
486 204 Determination of pH and a_w was conducted using pH meter GLP22 (Crison Instruments SA,
487
488 205 Barcelona, Spain) and water activity meter Aqualab 4TE (Decagon, Pullman, WA, USA),
489
490 206 respectively. The near-infrared spectrophotometer system for the determination of centesimal
491
492 207 composition (%) of fat, moisture, protein and total solids was used. Ricotta *fresca* samples were
493
494 208 accurately mixed, placed into Petri dishes and read in the light spectrum of 850-1050 nm using the
495
496 209 compositional FoodScan™ device (FOSS, Analytic, Hillerød, Denmark). The headspace gas
497
498
499 210 composition was conducted on MAP ricotta *fresca* samples on the sealed packages before
500
501 211 performing other analysis. Measure of combined residual O₂ % and CO₂ % were obtained piercing
502
503 212 the lid using a sterile needle connected to the Dansensor gas analyser (PBI Dansensor, Ringsted,
504
505 213 Denmark). To avoid gas leaks during the penetration of needle, 15 Ø mm septum (PBI Dansensor),
506
507 214 were applied on the film lid before measurements of headspace gas composition.

509 215 *2.6. Statistical analysis*

511 216 Differences among average microbiological group counts (\log_{10} cfu g⁻¹), headspace gas
512
513 217 concentration (%), intrinsic properties and centesimal composition (%) over time (T₀, T₇, T₁₄ and
514
515
516 218 T₂₁) and among types of samples (RfB, RfPf and RfPf+C) within one time point were compared
517
518 219 using Fisher's least significant difference test. Statistical analyses were performed with Statgraphics
519
520 220 Centurion XVI software (Stat Point Technologies, Warrenton, VA, USA). The effectiveness of
521
522 221 *Carnobacterium* spp in controlling the growth of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* was evaluated
523
524 222 computing the minimum difference (Δ) between of the \log_{10} cfu g⁻¹ between RfPf and RfPf+C
525
526 223 samples at each time point (T₇, T₁₄ and T₂₁).

3. Results

3.1. Microbiological profile

In *Ricotta fresca* blank samples the total bacterial count was $3.12 \pm 0.71 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_0 and gradually increased during refrigerated storage up to $6.34 \pm 0.87 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_{21} . The mesophilic lactic acid bacteria ranged between $2.25 \pm 0.06 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_0 and $3.83 \pm 1.06 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_{21} . *Enterobacteriaceae* were observed in one samples both at T_0 and at T_7 with counts of ca. $2 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$; their concentration increased to $3.48 \pm 0.58 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_{21} . *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* was never detected both in inoculated and blank samples. Natural contamination with *Pseudomonas* spp was observed in two samples out of nine with a mean count of $2.15 \pm 0.21 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_0 and increased to $6.48 \pm 0.78 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_{21} . In *ricotta fresca* samples inoculated with the protective culture, *Carnobacterium* spp. grew from the initial concentration of $6.36 \pm 0.32 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_0 to $8.78 \pm 0.25 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ at T_{21} . The comparison between *ricotta fresca* samples inoculated with *Pseudomonas* spp plus the protective culture and samples inoculated only with *Pseudomonas* spp showed similar level of initial contamination, ca. $2.30 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$. After 14 and 21 days of refrigerated storage *Pseudomonas* concentration was respectively 1.28 and $0.83 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ lower in *ricotta fresca* inoculated with *Carnobacterium* spp protective culture ($P < 0.05$).

Yeast and molds were occasionally reported, with maximum values below $4 \log_{10}$ at T_{21} . The complete microbiological profile with mean counts ($\log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$; $\bar{x} \pm \text{SD}$) over time is reported in table 2. *L. monocytogenes* was never detected on either blank samples and *ricotta* inoculated with biopreservatives. Microbiological analysis conducted on RfPf+Copen samples analyzed at T_{10} showed the following counts (within brackets positive samples over tested samples): total bacterial count $8.40 \pm 0.63 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ (n = 9/9), mesophilic lactic acid bacteria $3.12 \pm 0.41 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ (n = 6/9), *Carnobacterium* spp $6.90 \pm 1.89 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ (n = 9/9), *Enterobacteriaceae* $2.15 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ (n = 1/9), *Pseudomonas* spp $7.65 \pm 0.51 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ (n = 9/9), yeast and molds $2.86 \pm 0.43 \log_{10} \text{ cfu g}^{-1}$ (n = 5/9), while *L. monocytogenes* was never detected.

591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649

249 3.2. *Physico-chemical characteristics and MAP gas composition*

250 A moderate decrease of pH was observed over time in all *ricotta fresca* samples. However,
251 significant difference between blank samples and in samples inoculated with *Carnobacterium spp*
252 were observed only at T₂₁, showing respectively values of 6.60±0.04 and 6.48±0.07 (P<0.05). The
253 a_w was stable over time and between sample types ranging from 0.984±0.001 and 0.987±0.001. No
254 significant difference was observed among blank samples and ricotta inoculated with
255 biopreservatives in moisture, fat and protein composition, showing respectively a mean content of
256 72.38±3.15, 15.67±3.99 and 10.70±0.93. The O₂ content in the headspace increased from the initial
257 level of 0.52±0.24% up to 1.30±1.28% at T₇, to decrease again as low as 0.03±0.05 at T₂₁. Instead,
258 the CO₂ content decreased from T₀ to T₂₁ respectively from 16.71±0.61% to 7.16%. No significant
259 difference in gas composition were observed between blank and inoculated *ricotta fresca* samples.
260 Intrinsic properties, composition and gas composition in the headspace ($\bar{x} \pm SD$) during the
261 refrigerated storage are reported in table 3.

262 3.3. *Pseudomonas spp natural and artificial contamination*

263 From RfPf+C a total of 108 were confirmed as *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strains and typable by
264 PFGE. The comparison of the restriction profiles obtained showed that 103 strains (95.4%)
265 belonged to one of the five *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strains of the mix used for the artificial
266 contamination. Five strains (4.6%), showing a different restriction profile, were from natural
267 contamination.

269 4. Discussion

270 *Ricotta fresca* cheese is particularly susceptible of secondary contamination from the processing
271 environment and represents an excellent substrate for the growth of psychotropic pathogenic and
272 spoilage microorganisms (De Santis and Mazzette, 2002; De Santis *et al.* 2008; Ibba *et al.*, 2013;
273 Scarano *et al.*; 2014; Spanu *et al.*, 2016). Therefore, it is necessary to provide *ricotta fresca* with a

650
651
652 274 protection against the growth of unwanted bacteria. A possible strategy is the use of microbiological
653
654 275 cultures aimed to control the multiplication of contaminants. Previous investigation has been
655
656
657 276 conducted to assess the feasibility of using different biopreservatives in *ricotta fresca* (Spanu et al.,
658
659 277 2017). The study, conducted on naturally contaminated ricotta, indicated *Carnobacterium* spp as a
660
661 278 possible protective culture to be used to control the growth of *Pseudomonas* spp. The present study
662
663 279 was aimed to validate the efficacy of *Carnobacterium* spp inoculated on the surface of ricotta fresca
664
665 280 before packaging to control the growth of *Pseudomonas* spp in artificially contaminated samples.
666
667 281 The microbiological profile of controls (not inoculated) samples showed a natural initial
668
669 282 contamination level of *Pseudomonas* spp of ca. 2 log cfu g⁻¹. *Pseudomonas* spp grew to level as
670
671 283 high as 7 log cfu g⁻¹ after 21 days of refrigerated storage. *Carnobacterium* spp showed a good
672
673 284 adaptation to the substrate showing an increase in mean counts of ca. 2 log cfu g⁻¹ during
674
675
676 285 refrigerated storage. The use of *Carnobacterium* spp was effective in reducing *Pseudomonas* spp
677
678 286 concentration respectively of 1.28 log cfu g⁻¹ and 0.83 log cfu g⁻¹ after 14 and 21 days of storage.
679
680 287 These results are in agreement with previous studies conducted on naturally contaminated sheep
681
682 288 *ricotta fresca* (Spanu et al., 2017). This is explained by the level of artificial contamination used in
683
684 289 the present study, which was comparable with the natural level of *Pseudomonas* contamination. In
685
686 290 turn, this finding highlight the need of considering *ricotta fresca* as a “high risk” production and of
687
688 291 improving the procedures based on the HACCP principles put in place in Sardinian cheesemaking
689
690
691 292 plants. Despite the growth of *Carnobacterium* spp, little difference was observed in pH value
692
693 293 between ricotta fresca inoculated with the protective culture and control samples. Variation of pH
694
695 294 over time was comparable with previous observations (Pala et al., 2016; Spanu et al., 2017). No
696
697 295 significant differences were observed in a_w and composition between blank samples and samples
698
699 296 inoculated with *Carnobacterium* spp. However, the possible impact on sensory properties of the
700
701 297 protective culture should be further investigated. In the present study sensory analysis were not
702
703 298 performed because the level of *Pseudomonas* spp contamination at T₁₄ was already as high as 6
704
705
706
707
708

709
710
711 299 \log_{10} , compatible with possible alteration of the product. Before performing sensory analysis it is
712
713 300 necessary first to guarantee the safety of the product and the absence of any alteration that could
714
715
716 301 compromise acceptability of consumers.
717
718 302 The evolution of the gas composition in the headspace followed a trend which was expected. After
719
720 303 MAP packaging a residual concentration of ca. 0,52% O_2 persist in the headspace, which increases
721
722 304 during the first week of storage to above 1.0% and successively decrease until ca. 0.03% at T_{21} .
723
724 305 This could be explained with the release into the headspace of O_2 incorporated in the food matrix at
725
726 306 first, than the successive reduction is attributable to the consumption of O_2 during the successive
727
728 307 growth of the microorganisms. The differences in the CO_2 content in the headspace with respect to
729
730 308 the concentration used in the gas mixture was the result of prompt gas solving in the product, while
731
732
733 309 the successive CO_2 reduction could be related to permeability of the plastic lidding film.
734
735 310 To mimic foreseeable condition during retail selling after 7 days of refrigerated storage *Ricotta*
736
737 311 *fresca* samples were opened by removal of the film lid and exposing the product to atmospheric air.
738
739 312 Samples were then submitted to three days of thermal abuse (T_{10}) at $8\pm 2^\circ C$. Abused samples
740
741 313 showed a significant increase in aerobic mesophilic bacteria count and of *Pseudomonas* spp that
742
743 314 reached respectively, level as high as $8 \log \text{cfu g}^{-1}$ and $7.65 \log \text{cfu g}^{-1}$. This further confirms the
744
745 315 importance of the cold chain in preserving the microbiological durability of *ricotta fresca*.
746
747
748 316

749 317 **5. Conclusion**

751
752 318 The use of *Carnobacterium* spp as a protective culture, sprayed on the surface of *ricotta fresca*
753
754 319 during refrigerated storage, demonstrated to be effective to obtain a reduction of ca 1 log of
755
756 320 *Pseudomonas* spp growth. Despite *Carnobacterium* spp does not serve a single step against
757
758 321 *Pseudomonas*, it may be part of an integrated approach where several combined control measures
759
760 322 limit the growth of the microorganism to an acceptable level.
761

762 323

763
764
765
766
767

768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826

324 **Acknowledgements**

325 This work was funded by “Programma di Sviluppo Rurale Sardegna 2007-2013 Misura 124
326 Cooperazione per lo Sviluppo di Nuovi Prodotti, Processi e Tecnologie nei Settori Agricolo
327 Alimentare e in quello Forestale –project ID: H78F13000050007. The authors are grateful to all the
328 members of the joint dairy industry consortium “Associazione Temporanea di Scopo - Aziende
329 casearie Riunite” for their cooperation in the research.

331 **References**

- 332 1. Afzal, M.I., Jacquet, T., Delaunay, S., Borges, F., Millière, J.B., Revol-Junelles, A.M., &
333 Cailliez-Grimal, C. (2010). *Carnobacterium maltaromaticum*: identification, isolation tools,
334 ecology and technological aspects in dairy products. *Food microbiology*, 27(5), 573-579.
- 335 2. Andreani, N. A., Carraro, L., Martino, M. E., Fondi, M., Fasolato, L., Miotto, G., Magro,
336 M., Vianello, F., & Cardazzo, B. (2015). A genomic and transcriptomic approach to
337 investigate the blue pigment phenotype in *Pseudomonas fluorescens*. *International journal of*
338 *food microbiology*, 213, 88-98.
- 339 3. Buchanan, R.L., & Bagi, L.K. (1999). Microbial competition: effect of *Pseudomonas*
340 *fluorescens* on the growth of *Listeria monocytogenes*. *Food Microbiology*, 16 (5), 523-529.
- 341 4. CAC (codex Alimentarius Commission). (1971). Codex standard for whey cheeses. CODEX
342 STAN 284-71. Rev. 2010.
- 343 5. Cantoni, C., Stella, S., Cozzi, M., Iacumin, L., & Comi, G. (2003). Blue colouring in
344 mozzarella cheese. *Industrie Alimentari* 42: 840-843.
- 345 6. Carrascosa, C., Millán, R., Jaber, J.R., Lupiola, P., del Rosario-Quintana, C., Mauricio, C.,
346 & Sanjuán, E. (2015). Blue pigment in fresh cheese produced by *Pseudomonas fluorescens*.
347 *Food Control*, 54, 95-102.

827

828

829 348
830

831 349
832

833
834 350

835
836 351

837
838 352

839
840 353

841
842 354

843
844 355

845
846 356

847
848
849 357

850
851 358

852
853 359

854
855 360

856
857 361

858
859 362

860
861 363

862
863 364

864
865 365

866
867 366

868
869

870 367

871
872 368

873
874 369

875
876 370

877
878 371

879
880 372

881
882

883
884

885

7. Davies, E.A., Bevis, H.E., & Delves-Broughton, J. (1997). The use of the bacteriocin, nisin, as a preservative in ricotta-type cheeses to control the food-borne pathogen *Listeria monocytogenes*. *Letters in applied microbiology*, 24(5), 343.
8. De Santis, E.P.L., Mazzette, R., Scintu, M.F., Deriu, A., & Carta, A., 1999. Prove di produzione industriale della ricotta ovina confezionata: evoluzione dei parametri microbiologici nel corso della conservazione. *Atti IX Convegno Nazionale A.I.V.I.*
9. De Santis, E.P.L., Foddai, A., Viridis, S., Marongiu, P., Pilo, A. L., & Scarano, C. (2008). Toxin gene pattern in *Bacillus cereus* group strains isolated from sheep ricotta cheese. *Veterinary research communications*, 32, 323-326.
10. De Santis, E.P.L., & Mazzette, R. (2002). La ricotta un substrato ideale. *Caseus*, 7, 42-44.
11. De Vos D, Lim A Jr, Pirnay JP, Struelens M, Vandenvelde C, Duinslaeger L, Vanderkelen A, Cornelis P. Direct detection and identification of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in clinical samples such as skin biopsy specimens and expectorations by multiplex PCR based on two outer membrane lipoprotein genes, *oprI* and *oprL*. *Journal of Clinical Microbiology*, 1997; 35: 12958-9.
12. Elsser-Gravesen, D., & Elsser-Gravesen, A. (2013). Biopreservatives. In *Biotechnology of Food and Feed Additives* (pp. 29-49). Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
13. Gershman, M. D., Kennedy, D. J., Noble-Wang, J., Kim, C., Gullion, J., Kacica, Jensen, B., Pascoe, N., Saiman, McHale, J., Wilkins, M., Schoonmaker-Bopp, D., Clayton, J., Arduino, M., Srinivasan, A. (2008). Multistate outbreak of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* bloodstream infection after exposure to contaminated heparinized saline flush prepared by a compounding pharmacy. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, 47(11), 1372-1379.
14. Greenwood, M.H., Roberts, D., & Burden, P. (1991). The occurrence of *Listeria* species in milk and dairy products: a national survey in England and Wales. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* 12, 197-206.

886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944

- 373 15. Hammes, W.P., N. Weiss, and W. Holzapfel. 1992. The genera *Lactobacillus* and
374 *Carnobacterium*, in *The prokaryotes – A Handbook on the Biology of Bacteria:*
375 *Ecophysiology, Isolation, Identification, Application*, vol. 2, 2nd edn (eds A. Balows, H. G.
376 Trüper, M. Dworkin, W. Harder, and K.-H. Schleifer), Springer Verlag, New York, p. 1535–
377 1594.
- 378 16. Ibba, M., Cossu, F., Spanu, V., Viridis, S., Spanu, C., Scarano, C., & De Santis, E. P. (2013).
379 *Listeria monocytogenes* contamination in dairy plants: evaluation of *Listeria monocytogenes*
380 environmental contamination in two cheese-making plants using sheeps milk. *Italian Journal*
381 *of Food Safety*, 2(2), 31.
- 382 17. ISO 11290-1:1996/Amd 1. (2004a). *Microbiology of food and animal feeding stuffs-*
383 *Horizontal method for the detection and enumeration of Listeria monocytogenes. Part 1:*
384 *Detection method (1st ed.). Geneva, Switzerland: International Organization for*
385 *Standardization.*
- 386 18. ISO 11290-2:1998/Amd 1. (2004b). *Microbiology of food and animal feeding stuffs-*
387 *Horizontal method for the detection and enumeration of Listeria monocytogenes. Part 2:*
388 *Enumeration method (1st ed). Geneva, Switzerland: International Organization for*
389 *Standardization.*
- 390 19. ISO 6611/IDF094. (2004). *Milk and milk products - Enumeration of colony-forming units*
391 *of yeasts and/or moulds - Colony-count technique at 25 degrees C. Geneva, Switzerland:*
392 *International Organization for Standardization.*
- 393 20. ISO 6887-1 (1999). *Microbiology of food and animal feeding stuffs- Preparation of test*
394 *samples, initial suspension and decimal dilutions for microbiological examination. Part 1:*
395 *General rules for the preparation of the initial suspension and decimal dilutions. Geneva,*
396 *Switzerland: International Organization for Standardization.*

- 945
946
947 397
948
949
950 398
951
952 399
953
954 400
955
956 401
957
958 402
959
960
961 403
962
963 404
964
965 405
966
967 406
968
969 407
970
971 408
972
973 409
974
975
976 410
977
978 411
979
980 412
981
982 413
983
984 414
985
986 415
987
988 416
989
990
991 417
992
993 418
994
995 419
996
997 420
998
999 421
1000
1001
1002
1003
21. ISO/TS 11059. (2009). Milk and milk products - Method for the enumeration of *Pseudomonas* spp. Geneva, Switzerland: International Organization for Standardization.
 22. Laore, Agenzia regionale per lo sviluppo in agricoltura, 2015. L'agroalimentare a marchio di qualità. Formaggi Available at http://www.sardegnaagricoltura.it/documenti/14_43_20141006144130.pdf. Last accessed June 21, 2017.
 23. Leisner, J.J., Laursen, B.G., Prevost, H., Drider, D., & Dalgaard, P., 2007. Carnobacterium: positive and negative effects in the environment and in foods. *FEMS Microbiology Reviews* 31, 592e613
 24. Leriche, F., Bordessoulesb, A., Fayollea, K., Karoui, R., Lavalb, K., Leblanca, L., & Dufour, E. (2004). Alteration of raw-milk cheese by *Pseudomonas spp.*: monitoring the sources of contamination using fluorescence spectroscopy and metabolic profiling. *Journal of Microbiological Methods* 59: 33-41.
 25. Martin, N. H., Murphy, S. C., Ralyea, R. D., Wiedmann, M., & Boor, K. J. (2011). When cheese gets the blues: *Pseudomonas fluorescens* as the causative agent of cheese spoilage. *Journal of dairy science*, 94(6), 3176-3183.
 26. Martins, J. T., Cerqueira, M. A., Souza, B. W., do Carmo Avides, M. D., & Vicente, A. A. (2010). Shelf life extension of ricotta cheese using coatings of galactomannans from nonconventional sources incorporating nisin against *Listeria monocytogenes*. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 58(3), 1884-1891.
 27. Maslow, J. N. (1993). Application of pulsed-field gel electrophoresis to molecular epidemiology. *Diagnostic molecular microbiology: principles and applications*.
 28. Meyer, J.M., Geoffroy, V.A., Baida, N., Gardan, L., Izard, D., & Lemanceau, P. (2002). Siderophore typing, a powerful tool for the identification of fluorescent and non fluorescent pseudomonads. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 68: 2745-2753.

- 1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1060
1061
1062
- 422 29. National Advisory Committee on Microbiological Criteria for Foods. (2010). Parameters for
423 determining inoculated pack/challenge study protocols. *Journal of food protection*, 73(1),
424 140.
- 425 30. Pala, C., Scarano, C., Venusti, M., Sardo, D., Casti, D., Cossu, F., Lamon, S., Spanu, V.,
426 Ibba, M., Marras, M., Paba, A., & De Santis E.P.L. (2016). Shelf-life evaluation of sheep's
427 ricotta fresca cheese in modified atmosphere packaging. *Italian Journal of Food Safety*,
428 5(3), 134-139.
- 429 31. Pintado, M. E., Macedo, A. C., Malcata, F. X., Macedo, A. C., & Malcata, F. X. (2001).
430 Review: Technology, chemistry and microbiology of whey cheeses. *Food Science and*
431 *Technology International*, 7, 105–116.
- 432 32. Pintado, M.E., & Malcata, F.X. (2000). Characterization of whey cheese packaged under
433 vacuum. *Journal of food protection*, 63(2), 216-221.
- 434 33. Samelis, J., Kakouri, A., Rogga, K. J., Savvaidis, I. N., & Kontominas, M. G. (2003). Nisin
435 treatments to control *Listeria monocytogenes* post-processing contamination on Anthotyros,
436 a traditional Greek whey cheese, stored at 4 C in vacuum packages. *Food Microbiology*,
437 20(6), 661-669.
- 438 34. Scarano, C., Giacometti, F., Manfreda, G., Lucchi, A., Pes, E., Spanu, C., De Santis, E.P.L.,
439 & Serraino, A. (2014). *Arcobacter butzleri* in sheep ricotta cheese at retail and related
440 sources of contamination in an industrial dairy plant. *Applied and environmental*
441 *microbiology*, 80(22), 7036-7041.
- 442 35. Scarpellini M, Franzetti L, Galli A. Development of PCR assay to identify *Pseudomonas*
443 *fluorescens* and its biotype. *FEMS Microbiology Letters*, 2004, 236: 257-60.
- 444 36. Spanu, C., Scarano, C., Ibba, M., Pala, C., Spanu, V., & De Santis, E. P. L. (2014).
445 Microbiological challenge testing for *Listeria monocytogenes* in ready-to-eat food: a
446 practical approach. *Italian journal of food safety*, 3(4).

- 1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1120
1121
- 447 37. Spanu, C., Scarano, C., Spanu, V., Pala, C., Casti, D., Lamon, S., Cossu, F., Ibba, M.,
448 Nieddu, G., & De Santis, E.P.L. (2016). Occurrence and behavior of *Bacillus cereus* in
449 naturally contaminated ricotta salata cheese during refrigerated storage. *Food microbiology*,
450 58, 135-138.
- 451 38. Spanu, C., Scarano, C., Piras, F., Spanu, V., Pala, C., Casti, D., ... & De Santis, E. P. L.
452 (2017). Testing commercial biopreservative against spoilage microorganisms in MAP
453 packed Ricotta fresca cheese. *Food Microbiology*, 66, 72-76.
- 454 39. Uyttendaele, M., Rajkovic, A., Benos, G., Francois, K., Devlieghere, F., & Debevere, J.
455 (2004). Evaluation of a challenge testing protocol to assess the stability of ready-to-eat
456 cooked meat products against growth of *Listeria monocytogenes*. *International Journal of*
457 *Food Microbiology*, 90(2), 219-236.
- 458 40. Tirloni, E., Ghelardi, E., Celandroni, F., Bernardi, C., Casati, R., Rosshaug, P. S., & Stella,
459 S. (2017). *Bacillus cereus* in fresh ricotta: Comparison of growth and Haemolysin BL
460 production after artificial contamination during production or post processing. *Food Control*,
461 79, 272-278.

Table 1. Experimental design: number of *Ricotta fresca* samples and types of analysis performed at each sampling time.

Analysis	type of samples	Sampling time					Total
		T ₀	T ₇	T ₁₀	T ₁₄	T ₂₁	
- Microbiological profile: aerobic mesophilic bacteria; mesophilic lactic acid bacteria; <i>Enterobacteriaceae</i> ; <i>Pseudomonas</i> spp; L. monocytogenes; <i>Carnobacterium</i> spp; yeast and molds.	RfB	9	9	-	9	9	36
	RfPf	9	9	-	9	9	36
	RfPf+C	9	9	-	9	9	36
	RfPf+C _{open}	-	-	9	-	-	9
- Intrinsic properties: pH and a _w ; composition (%): moisture; fat; protein;	Ph-Ch	9	9	9	9	9	45
- Headspace composition (%): CO ₂ ; O ₂							
Total		36	36	18	36	36	162

T₀ = day of inoculum; T₇, T₁₀, T₁₄, and T₂₁= respectively 7, 10, 14 and 21 days of storage after the inoculum. RfB: not inoculated blank samples; RfPf: samples inoculated with *Pseudomonas fluorescens*; RfPf+C: samples inoculated with both *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Carnobacterium* spp; RfPf+C_{open}: samples inoculated with both *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Carnobacterium* spp and stored refrigerated after the removal of the film lid; Ph-Ch: samples used for the determination of intrinsic properties, composition and headspace gas.

Table 2. Evolution of the microbiological profile (\log_{10} cfu g^{-1} ; $\bar{x} \pm SD$) of ricotta during refrigerated storage by sample type.

Microbial group	Type of samples	Day of storage			
		T ₀	T ₇	T ₁₄	T ₂₁
Aerobic mesophilic bacteria	RfB	3.1±0.7 ^{a1} (n = 9/9)	4.7±0.8 ^{b1} (n = 9/9)	5.7±0.8 ^{c1} (n = 9/9)	6.3±0.9 ^{c1} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf	3.0±0.7 ^{a1} (n = 9/9)	5.0±0.5 ^{b2} (n = 9/9)	7.6±0.5 ^{c1} (n = 9/9)	8.3±0.3 ^{d2} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf+C	2.8±1.3 ^{a1} (n = 9/9)	6.9±1.1 ^{b2} (n = 9/9)	8.6±0.4 ^{c2} (n = 9/9)	9.1±1.3 ^{c3} (n = 9/9)
mesophilic lactic acid bacteria	RfB	2.3±0.1 ^{ab1} (n = 4/9)	1.7±0.6 ^{a1} (n = 6/9)	2.8±0.9 ^{b12} (n = 6/9)	3.8±1.1 ^{c1} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf	2.1±0.5 ^{a1} (n = 6/9)	3.3±0.8 ^{b2} (n = 8/9)	3.7±0.8 ^{b2} (n = 8/9)	5.0±0.1 ^{c2} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf+C	3.5±1.1 ^{a2} (n = 6/9)	3.0±1.0 ^{ab2} (n = 8/9)	2.5±0.4 ^{a1} (n = 5/9)	2.9±0.9 ^{a3} (n = 9/9)
<i>Enterobacteriaceae</i>	RfB	ND	ND	2.6±1.0 ^{a1} (n = 3/9)	3.2±0.9 ^{a1} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf	2.0±0.0 ^a (n = 1/9)	1.9±0.0 ^a (n = 1/9)	2.4±0.9 ^{a1} (n = 5/9)	3.9±0.6 ^{a1} (n = 5/9)
	RfPf+C	ND	1.9±0.0 ^{ab} (n = 1/9)	1.5±0.8 ^{a1} (n = 4/9)	3.1±0.7 ^{b1} (n = 6/9)
<i>Pseudomonas</i> spp	RfB	2.1±0.2 ^{a1} (n = 2/9)	4.5±1.0 ^{b1} (n = 8/9)	5.6±1.3 ^{c1} (n = 8/9)	6.5±0.8 ^{c1} (n = 6/9)
	RfPf	2.3±0.4 ^{a1} (n = 9/9)	5.3±0.6 ^{b2} (n = 9/9)	8.2±0.3 ^{c2} (n = 9/9)	8.6±0.4 ^{c2} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf+C	2.3±0.3 ^{a1} (n = 9/9)	4.8±0.5 ^{b12} (n = 9/9)	6.9±0.7 ^{c3} (n = 9/9)	7.8±0.6 ^{d3} (n = 9/9)
Yeast and molds	RfB	ND	ND	ND	ND
	RfPf	2.7±0.3 ^{a1} (n = 3/9)	3.2±0.6 ^{a1} (n = 4/9)	3.5±0.7 ^{a1} (n = 8/9)	3.6±0.9 ^{a1} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf+C	2.4±0.1 ^{ab1} (n = 3/9)	2.8±0.1 ^{ab1} (n = 2/9)	2.5±1.0 ^{a2} (n = 8/9)	3.9±0.9 ^{b1} (n = 3/9)
<i>Carnobacterium</i> spp	RfB	2.6±0.5 ^{a1} (n = 4/9)	3.1±0.9 ^{ab1} (n = 7/9)	3.2±1.1 ^{ab1} (n = 9/9)	4.2±1.2 ^{b1} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf	2.1±0.5 ^{a1} (n = 7/9)	3.4±0.4 ^{b1} (n = 8/9)	4.1±0.4 ^{c2} (n = 9/9)	4.8±0.9 ^{d1} (n = 9/9)
	RfPf+C	6.4±0.3 ^{a2} (n = 9/9)	6.9±0.6 ^{b2} (n = 9/9)	7.9±0.6 ^{c3} (n = 9/9)	8.8±0.3 ^{d2} (n = 9/9)

T₀ = day of inoculum; T₇, T₁₀, T₁₄, and T₂₁ = respectively 7, 10, 14 and 21 days of storage after the inoculum. RfB: not inoculated blank samples; RfPf: samples inoculated with *Pseudomonas fluorescens*; RfPf+C: samples inoculated with both *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Carnobacterium* spp; Means in the same row with different superscript letter were significantly different ($P < 0.05$); means in the same column among type of samples with different superscript number were significantly different ($P < 0.05$). Values within brackets indicate the prevalence of positive samples.

Table 3. Intrinsic properties, physico-chemical characteristics and MAP gas composition ($\bar{x} \pm SD$) of ricotta during refrigerated storage by sample type.

Parameters	Type of samples	Day of storage			
		T ₀	T ₇	T ₁₄	T ₂₁
pH	RfB	6.7±0.1 ^{a1}	6.6±0.2 ^{a1}	6.6±0.1 ^{a1}	6.6±0.0 ^{a1}
	RfPf	6.8±0.1 ^{a1}	6.6±0.1 ^{ab1}	6.6±0.0 ^{b1}	6.6±0.0 ^{ab1}
	RfPf+C	6.8±0.1 ^{a1}	6.7±0.1 ^{ab1}	6.6±0.1 ^{bc1}	6.5±0.1 ^{c2}
a _w	RfB	0.986 ± 0.001 ^{a1}	0.987 ± 0.001 ^{a1}	0.987 ± 0.001 ^{a1}	0.987 ± 0.001 ^{a1}
	RfPf	0.987 ± 0.001 ^{a1}	0.986 ± 0.001 ^{b1}	0.986 ± 0.001 ^{a1}	0.987 ± 0.001 ^{ab1}
	RfPf+C	0.987 ± 0.001 ^{a1}	0.984 ± 0.001 ^{b1}	0.985 ± 0.001 ^{b1}	0.986 ± 0.001 ^{ab1}
Moisture (%)	RfB	71.8±4.9 ^{a1}	71.4±2.8 ^{a1}	72.6±2.8 ^{a1}	71.9±2.4 ^{a1}
	RfPf	70.9±3.0 ^{a1}	72.0±5.0 ^{a1}	72.6±5.7 ^{a1}	74.3±1.3 ^{a1}
	RfPf+C	73.0±4.0 ^{a1}	72.0±3.8 ^{a1}	71.2±3.9 ^{a1}	74.2±1.4 ^{a1}
Fat (%)	RfB	17.3±5.7 ^{a1}	16.9±4.3 ^{a1}	13.9±2.0 ^{a1}	15.6±2.6 ^{a1}
	RfPf	17.3±4.4 ^{a1}	15.8±5.6 ^{a1}	15.2±6.7 ^{a1}	15.0±2.6 ^{a1}
	RfPf+C	15.8±6.8 ^{a1}	16.9±4.7 ^{a1}	17.3±3.9 ^{a1}	12.6±1.8 ^{a1}
Protein (%)	RfB	10.1±1.2 ^{a1}	10.6±0.4 ^{a1}	11.0±0.8 ^{a1}	11.2±1.0 ^{a1}
	RfPf	11.1±1.2 ^{a1}	10.8±1.5 ^{a1}	10.3±0.1 ^{a1}	11.4±1.6 ^{a1}
	RfPf+C	10.2±1.2 ^{a1}	10.0±0.8 ^{a1}	10.2±1.2 ^{a1}	10.7±0.3 ^{a1}
O ₂ %	RfB	0.7±0.3 ^{ab1}	1.1±0.3 ^{ab1}	1.8±0.6 ^{b1}	0.0±0.0 ^{a1}
	RfPf	0.5±0.2 ^{a1}	1.2±0.1 ^{b1}	0.1±0.2 ^{c2}	0.1±0.1 ^{c1}
	RfPf+C	0.4±0.1 ^{a1}	1.6±2.5 ^{a1}	0.2±0.2 ^{a2}	0.0±0.0 ^{a1}
CO ₂ %	RfB	16.4±0.5 ^{a1}	8.1±1.5 ^{b1}	5.9±0.5 ^{c1}	6.7±0.6 ^{bc1}
	RfPf	16.9±0.1 ^{a1}	7.9±1.0 ^{b1}	6.6±0.2 ^{c1}	7.2±0.2 ^{bc12}
	RfPf+C	16.8±1.0 ^{a1}	8.5±0.8 ^{b1}	7.0±1.1 ^{b1}	7.6±0.4 ^{b2}

T₀ = day of inoculum; T₇, T₁₀, T₁₄, and T₂₁= respectively 7, 10, 14 and 21 days of storage after the inoculum. RfB: not inoculated blank samples; RfPf: samples inoculated with *Pseudomonas fluorescens*; RfPf+C: samples inoculated with both *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Carnobacterium* spp; Means in the same row with different superscript letter were significantly different (P<0.05); means in the same column among type of samples with different superscript number were significantly different (P<0.05).