

In vitro culture of sheep early-antral follicles: Milestones, challenges and future perspectives

Questa è la versione Post print del seguente articolo:

Original

In vitro culture of sheep early-antral follicles: Milestones, challenges and future perspectives / Ebrahimi, M.; Dattena, M.; Luciano, A. M.; Succu, S.; Gadau, S. D.; Mara, L.; Chessa, F.; Berlinguer, F.. - In: THERIOGENOLOGY. - ISSN 0093-691X. - 213:(2024), pp. 114-123. [10.1016/j.theriogenology.2023.09.025]

Availability:

This version is available at: 11388/334449 since: 2024-06-27T15:36:10Z

Publisher:

Published

DOI:10.1016/j.theriogenology.2023.09.025

Terms of use:

Chiunque può accedere liberamente al full text dei lavori resi disponibili come "Open Access".

Publisher copyright

note finali coverpage

(Article begins on next page)

This is the Author's accepted manuscript version of the following contribution:

In vitro culture of sheep early-antral follicles: Milestones, challenges and future perspectives / Ebrahimi, M.; Dattena, M.; Luciano, A. M.; Succu, S.; Gadau, S. D.; Mara, L.; Chessa, F.; Berlinguer, F.. - In: THERIOGENOLOGY. - ISSN 0093-691X. - 213:(2024), pp. 114-123. [10.1016/j.theriogenology.2023.09.025]

The publisher's version is available at:

<https://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.theriogenology.2023.09.025>

When citing, please refer to the published version.

Theriogenology

In vitro culture of sheep early-antral follicles: milestones, challenges and future perspectives --Manuscript Draft--

Manuscript Number:	
Article Type:	Review Article
Keywords:	Sheep; Culture Medium; Oocyte; Pre-antral follicle; In vitro culture
Corresponding Author:	Mohammadreza Ebrahimi, Ph.D. University of Sassari Department of Veterinary Medicine SASSARI, Sassari ITALY
First Author:	Mohammadreza Ebrahimi, Ph.D.
Order of Authors:	Mohammadreza Ebrahimi, Ph.D. Maria Dattena, PhD/DVM Alberto Maria Luciano, PhD/DVM Sara Succu, PhD/DVM Sergio Domenico Gadau, PhD/DVM Laura Mara Fabrizio Chessa Fiammetta Berlinguer, PhD/DVM
Abstract:	<p>Early antral follicles (EAFs) can represent an easily exploitable reserve for the production of mature oocytes in livestock, as they are more abundant than antral follicles (AFs) and need less culture period compared to the other pre-antral follicles (PFs).</p> <p>Despite some impressive achievements, maturation, cleavage, and blastocyst rates are still far below the standard of in vitro embryo production system (IVP) in ruminant species. The difficulty is related to the development of suitable in vitro culture systems tailored with nutrients, growth factors, and other signaling molecules which should supported oocyte growth. In this review we focus on in vitro development of sheep EAFs to provide an informative reference about current research progress in the in vitro culture systems, medium supplementation, challenges, and future perspectives.</p>
Suggested Reviewers:	Barbara Barboni, PhD.DVM professor, University of Teramo bbarboni@unite.it Eduardo Gastal, PhD.DVM professor, Southern Illinois University Carbondale egastal@siu.edu

In vitro culture of sheep early-antral follicles: milestones, challenges and future perspectives

Authors:

Mohammadreza Ebrahimi¹, Maria Dattena², Alberto Maria Luciano³, Sara Succu¹, Sergio Domenico Gadau¹, Laura Mara², Fabrizio Chessa², Fiammetta Berlinguer¹

¹ Department of Veterinary Medicine, University of Sassari, Via Vienna 2, Sassari, Italy

² Department of Animal Science, Agricultural Research Agency of Sardinia, 07100 Sassari, Italy

³ Reproductive and Developmental Biology Laboratory, Department of Health, Animal Science and Food Safety, University of Milan, Via Celoria, 10 - 20133, Milan, Italy

Abstract

Early antral follicles (EAFs) can represent an easily exploitable reserve for the production of mature oocytes in livestock, as they are more abundant than antral follicles (AFs) and need less culture period compared to the other pre-antral follicles (PFs).

Despite some impressive achievements, maturation, cleavage, and blastocyst rates are still far below the standard of in vitro embryo production system (IVP) in ruminant species. The difficulty is related to the development of suitable in vitro culture systems tailored with nutrients, growth factors, and other signaling molecules which should supported oocyte growth. In this review we focus on in vitro development of sheep EAFs to provide an informative reference about current research progress in the in vitro culture systems, medium supplementation, challenges, and future perspectives.

Keywords: Sheep, Culture Medium, Oocyte, Pre-antral follicle, In vitro culture

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

311. Introduction

In sheep, throughout the reproductive life span around 80,000 primordial follicles are recruited for growth, and only a small number of this genetic pool will ovulate, while the rest of them undergo atresia during folliculogenesis [1]. This represents an untapped potential that can be used to preserve the fertility of high genetic merit animals and endangered species [2]. However, the exploitation of the entire ovarian germinal cell reservoir is not yet possible. In vitro growth of primordial follicles in the ovarian cortex to produce mature oocytes is still at an experimental stage [3]. Oocytes at early stages of their differentiation enclosed in preantral and small antral follicles are discarded from routine in vitro embryo production (IVEP) protocols as they must complete growth and development to attain full meiotic and embryonic developmental competence. The population of early antral follicles (EAFs), instead, may represent a reserve of oocytes close to completing the growth phase, which might be more easily exploited in vitro and could increase the number of female gametes dedicated to IVEP [4]. Being larger and at more advanced stage of development, EAFs require a shorter culture period to achieve the developmental competence than secondary follicles ($\leq 300\mu\text{m}$ vs $350\text{-}500\mu\text{m}$, Fig 1).

Accordingly, several efforts have been made to develop a suitable in vitro culture system that can provide an optimal environment for EAFs to survive and develop. For instance, after in vitro culture of EAFs variable oocyte maturation rates have been reported in cow (5–79%) [5, 6, 7,], goat (24.1-46%) [9] and pig (58-68%) [10, 11]. Although these results are promising, only a limited number of embryo have been produced in cow and goat [7,12] with no live born.

In sheep, after developing the follicle isolation methods [13,14], the first obtention of matured oocyte (MII) from in vitro culture of late secondary and EAFs (follicle sizes: $150\text{-}250\mu\text{m}$ and $250\text{-}400\mu\text{m}$) was reported by Tamilmani et al (2005). Subsequently, successful of in vitro oocyte maturation increased up to 68% [16]. However, despite recent promising reports [17,18], no successful embryo development beyond the morula stage (16.28% of cleaved cells) has been reported until now [16]. In general terms, in this species, the overall efficiency is still low and only a variable number of matured oocytes and embryos with no successful parturition have been reported. The success of this procedure depends on several factors including: initial follicle/oocyte size [16], medium supplementation [19], reproductive state of the ovary donor [20], culture period, frequency

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

of medium replacement [21], the composition of culture medium [16], etc. The low and variable outcomes indicate that the culture conditions still need to be optimized and standardized [22,23].

In this review, we briefly resume the physiological aspect of oocyte growth and follicle formation. Then, we focus on the factors involved in the in vitro culture of EAFs with emphasis on medium supplementations to provide a new perspective for identifying the base culture medium, and supplements (hormones, growth factors, etc). To do this, we reviewed the published papers on sheep as an animal model which is cost-effective, more accessible, and has comparable characteristics to human ovaries [24].

2.9. Basic aspects of folliculogenesis in sheep

In sheep, folliculogenesis initiates with the breakdown of germ cell clusters and the formation of primordial follicles at approximately 65-75 days of gestation [25]. The primordial follicle contains an oocyte surrounded by a single layer of squamous pre-granulosa cells which is in turn surrounded by a basal membrane; this forms the smallest ovarian follicle units and it is defined as the ovarian reserve pool [26]. These follicles continuously grow and leave the reserve pool of quiescent follicles (recruitment or primordial follicular activation) to become transitional and primary follicles (growing phase). Subsequently, they develop to the secondary follicles by the addition of a second layer of granulosa cells, the initial deposition of zona pellucida (ZP) and the beginning of theca cell layer formation [27,28].

As the follicle diameter and hence the distance between the oocyte and blood vessels increases, the antrum filled with follicular fluid is formed among the granulosa cells to convey nutrients, gases, and signaling molecules to the innermost cells and oocyte [29,30]. At this stage, the tertiary follicles (also known as early antral follicles) are formed and the oocyte diameter reaches around 110µm (Fig 1) [31, 32]. Also at this stage, the granulosa cells are gonadotrophin responsive and in proliferation while embracing a meiotically arrested oocyte [20,30]. During this process, the oocytes are still growing, meiotically non-competent, transcriptionally active, display low levels of global DNA methylation and store a large amount of RNA [2,33,34]. Additionally, a bidirectional communication between cumulus cells and oocytes takes place, as well as changes in carbohydrate and lipid metabolism.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

Throughout the secondary/EAF transition the chromatin configuration changes from diffuse chromatin (non-surrounding nucleus-NSN pattern, Fig2) to the condensed chromatin configuration (surrounding nucleolus-SN pattern, Fig 2). In the more advanced phase of oocyte development (124.7 ± 6.5µm), they display a new pattern of chromatin configuration in which the condensed chromatin appear partly around the nucleolus and partly close to the nuclear envelope (SNE configuration, Fig 2) [35,36]. Also, a phase of structural changes and spatial differentiation occurs as the follicle grows including Golgi, endoplasmic reticulum and mitochondria position [32]. These changes require the appropriate expression of numerous genes such BMP15, DNMT1, GDF9, MOS, ZAR1 and orchestrated communication between the two main compartments (oocytes and granulosa cells) [37,38].

Regulation of this transition includes a complex interaction among endocrine, paracrine and autocrine factors which in turn affects steroidogenesis, angiogenesis, follicular atresia, oocyte growth, and maturation as well as the proliferation and differentiation of follicular cells.

As the process of maturation progresses, one or several follicles (in mono- or poly-ovulatory species, respectively) are selected and undergo final maturation. In sheep, it takes 154 to 165 days for the primordial follicle to develop into the early antral follicle stage (0.5 mm in diameter- Fig 1), and then an additional five days to reach the small antral follicle stage (2.2 mm in diameter) [39, 40]

3. Isolation of EAFs (methods and recovery rate)

Among the different methods used for follicle isolation (mechanical, enzymatic, or combination of both), microdissection is the most common for EAFs isolation. In this method, follicles are isolated from a thin ovarian slice (2-3 mm) by using two gauge needles (22-26 G) fitted to 1mL syringe barrels [31,41]. In comparison with other methods, microdissection is simple, cheap and can maintain the integrity of the follicle, preserving interactions between oocytes/granulosa cells and minimizing the risk of rupturing the basal membrane [42,43]. However, due to the dense connective tissue surrounding the EAFs, the isolation procedure is difficult and time-consuming [44]. Accordingly, the number of isolated EAFs is limited. In contrast, the enzymatic method can easily isolate more follicles by incubation of ovarian cortical fragments with adequate concentration of specific enzymes (hyaluronidase, collagenase or trypsin) [45–47]. This method, besides being more

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

expensive, may cause damage to the follicles and oocytes, especially in the basement membrane [48,49]. Therefore, the mechanical method is more common for the isolation of ruminant EAFs. The number of isolated follicles by mechanical methods may be affected by many factors such as operators, breeds, species, and seasons [34,39,50,51]. For example, in seasonal breeders, such as the sheep, there are more PFs and fewer AFs during the anoestrous period which suggests that the total number of growing PFs is increasing in anoestrus and falling in the breeding season whilst the antral follicle population follows an inverse fluctuation [39]. Accordingly, the number of sheep EAFs in the reproductive season can vary from 30 follicles in high ovulation breeds to 8-12 follicles in low ovulation breeds [39]. Despite the high number of EAFs in the ovaries, the recovery rate by using the usual mechanical methods is still low and labored [52]. In this regard, Chakravarthi et al (2015) indicated that 5 to 10 preantral, 5 to 10 early antral, 3 to 5 antral, and 1 to 2 large antral follicles could be routinely isolated from each ovary. However, the breed and season are not mentioned. In addition, age, hormone concentration, ovarian size and presence or absence of corpus luteum influence the quantity and quality of recovered follicles from slaughtered animals [51,54]. For example, during the breeding season, a big part of the ovaries is occupied with the corpus luteum which limits the accessibility to the ovarian cortex. Therefore, due to the abovementioned variations and also to the isolation methods, the recovery rate of late secondary follicles and EAFs from each ovary can vary from 4-6 to 5-10 follicles, respectively [53,55].

4. In vitro culture of sheep EAFs

4.1 In vitro culture systems of EAFs

Selecting the appropriate in vitro follicle culture system based on the follicle stages (primary, secondary and etc.) and the desired culture duration is crucial for ensuring optimal growth [56,57].

For the EAFs, in vitro culture of isolated follicles is the most established technique, in which the whole follicles (with the intact basement membrane) are cultured either in a two-dimensional (2D) or a three-dimensional (3D) system [42,56].

The 2D follicle culture systems have great diversity, such as the droplet method, microplate culture, and culture plate inversion culture [58,59]. Among those, the microplate method is the most commonly used due to its versatility and ease of use [56,60]. However, this system showed

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

to be inefficient in maintaining the normal architecture of follicles especially during the long-term in vitro culture (more than 4 days) [56]. This is due to the GCs adhering to the bottom of the culture dish, which can cause loss of the original spherical shape and disrupt gap junctional communication [61,62]. Despite this, the 2D culture system is the only ones used in published literature for in vitro culture of sheep EAFs (Table 1).

On the other hand, the 3D culture system has gained attention as an alternative, especially for long in vitro culture of follicle, as follicles are embedded in an extracellular matrix (alginate, hyaluronan hydrogel, PVP, and etc.) that provides the right balance between rigidity and elasticity to support the spherical shape of the follicles and prevent disruption of gap junctions [19,60,62–64]. However, the use of 3D culture system for in vitro culture of large follicles such as sheep EAFs (which are 350-500µm in size) faces certain challenges. One of the main issues is the presence of the follicle basement membrane and limited penetration of oxygen and nutrients (less than 200µm) in the culture medium which may restrict their diffusion to the central part of the EAFs [65,66]. As a results, a new approach has been developed that involves using isolated cumulus oocyte complexes (COCs) to improve the exchange of gases and nutrients between the medium and the oocyte [67,68]. Positive outcomes from this culture system have been obtained in cattle, with embryo production rates reaching 30% of cleaved embryos [69], there is currently insufficient evidence to support its effectiveness in sheep.

4.2 Culture conditions

In vitro culture conditions are critical for the growth and survival of follicles in a laboratory setting. These conditions include the duration of the in vitro culture, concentration of gases, volume of culture medium, replacement interval of culture medium, type of culturing dish and medium composition.

4.2.1 Duration of in vitro culture

The time required for a follicle to reach the optimum size of antral follicle, in which the oocyte inside is able to resume meiosis, is species-specific and can vary depending on the follicular phase, culture medium, and method employed [68]. In sheep, it takes approximately five days for EAFs containing immature oocytes ($110 \pm 5\mu\text{m}$) to achieve full meiotic competence through in vivo

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

development ($130 \pm 5\mu\text{m}$ - Fig 1) [59,70]. Nevertheless, different durations of EAFs culture were reported in the published literature to achieve full meiotic competency (Table 1). This variability could be attributed to differences in the size of EAFs used (ranging from 250 to 500 μm), season, breed or cultured conditions.

4.2.2 Concentration of gases

The composition and concentration of gases, especially oxygen, are critical factors that must be adjusted to mimic in vivo conditions. Low oxygen levels can lead to oocyte hypoxia, especially when there are multiple layers of granulosa cells around the oocyte, which can impede oxygen distribution. Conversely, high oxygen levels can trigger oxidative stress and apoptosis [71,72]. Studies on human follicular fluid have shown that the mean dissolved oxygen levels are low at the initial formation of the early antral follicle (~1.5 vol%) and peak in the later phase (~6.7 vol%) as the follicle grows [73]. However, in all studies on in vitro culture of sheep EAFs (Table 1) and even other animals like cow [67] and goat [12], a higher concentration of oxygen (5% CO₂ in air or 18.6% oxygen) was used than the reported level of dissolved oxygen in follicular fluid [73,74]. This apparent paradox may be a consequence of oxygen's slower diffusion through aqueous media and the underappreciated effects of cell density, media volume, and barometric pressure on pericellular oxygen concentration in cell culture systems [74]. Therefore, since no studies have determined the specific concentration of oxygen required for in vitro culture of EAFs, it would be of interest for such experiments to be conducted in order to more accurately mimic in vivo conditions in the culturing system.

4.2.3 Volume of culture medium

The volume of the culture medium should be carefully adjusted to meet the nutrient demands of the cells, prevent osmolarity fluctuations, absorb toxic substances produced by the cells, and maintain other beneficial factors secreted by follicle cells [75]. In previous studies on in vitro culture of sheep EAFs, researchers typically used a microdrop culture system, in which small volumes of medium (10-100 μl - Table 1) were covered with mineral oil to prevent osmolarity fluctuations. However,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

mineral oil poses a high risk as it can reduce bioavailability of liposoluble substances (e.g. progesterone and estradiol), and release several toxic substances (Triton X, alkenes, and aldehydes) into the medium [76]. To avoid these undesirable effects, an alternative oil-free culture system has been developed in other species, where a high volume of medium (200 µl) is used to prevent osmolarity changes [67,77]. However, using a high volume of medium can dilute specific compounds derived from follicular cells and can affect gas exchanges due to the high volume and depth over the follicle [74].

Generally, determining the optimal volume of in vitro culture medium is challenging and several variation such as the type of culture dish, gas pressure and liquid surface area should be considered [74,78,79]. Therefore, since the medium is an essential part of cell culture, further studies are necessary to determine the best volume of medium for in vitro culture of EAFs.

4.2.4 Replacement interval of culture medium

Replacing the culture medium after specific time periods is necessary to avoid nutrient exhaustion and the accumulation of toxic products. The optimal replacement interval of the culture medium varies depending on several factors, such as the type of medium used (TCM or α MEM), the culture system (2D or 3D), and the specific requirements of the EAFs [21,75]. In general, it is recommended to replace half of the medium every 2 days for most in vitro culture systems, including microdrop and oil-free culture systems [31,55]. Other authors used a longer replacement intervals (3 or 6 days) to minimize fluctuations in the culture conditions [15,21]. While medium replacement may result in better growth and development, it could also remove benefit substances from the medium. Periodic addition of fresh medium without removing the old medium can thus be an alternative option [75].

4.2.5 Type of culture dishes

To the best of our information, most researchers on the in vitro culture of sheep EAFs has utilized a petri dish with diameters of 35 and 60 cm (Table 1). Few authors used 96-well microplates with either V-shaped [59,80,81] or flat bottom [67]. However, we did not find any additional information comparing the impact of petri dish size, material, or type on EAF culture outcomes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

Nevertheless, it may be beneficial to consider some general characteristics of culture dishes to optimize successful EAF culture.

Among cell culture dishes, polystyrene dishes have become popular due to their ease of use and low cost. However, their hydrophobic surface can make it difficult for cells to attach [82]. However, long in vitro culture of follicles and COCs revealed that granulosa cells can attach to the petri dish bottom, leading to gap junction dysfunction which plays an essential role in oocyte growth and development. Due to this, various systems including encapsulation of follicles [83,84], use of treated/hydrophobic membranes [16,85,86], or daily transfer of the follicles to a new well [87] have been used to prevent attachment and preserve the structural integrity of follicles. The efficiency of these methods still need to be evaluated.

To choose the best type of culture dish, it should be noted that the petri dish requires a high ratio of mineral oil to medium, which can sink the follicles in a pool of toxic substances and absorb liposoluble substances from the medium [88]. Alternatively, in the case of 96-well microplates, osmolarity can be regulated without mineral oil by adding water to the corner of the plate. However, it is important to take into account that the “edge effect” (where evaporation from the corner and edge wells is greater than that from the interior wells) could affect the usability of these plates [89]. Future studies will likely provide more information for selecting the best culture dish.

4.3 Medium composition

Successful in vitro culture of EAFs requires the provision of nutrients, cytokines, growth factors, and hormones in a tightly regulated environment that mimics the physiological conditions of follicular development. Several commercial media have been investigated for the in vitro culture of EAFs, including α -MEM, TCM-199, and Waymouth (Tables 1). Among these, TCM-199 has been found to better support the development of sheep EAFs compared to the other media [90,91]. TCM-199 contains a richer composition of nutrients and growth factors that promote cell viability and follicular development [92,93]. As an alternative to TCM-199, α -MEM can be used if fresh medium is continuously added. Indeed, to identify the best in vitro culture medium for sheep EAFs, the supplementations and replacement interval of the medium should be carefully considered [55].

In addition to the choice of the medium, the supplementation of antioxidants, growth factors and developmental stage-dependent hormones is critical for the successful in vitro culture of EAFs

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

[21,34,42,94]. The successful in vitro culture of EAFs is indeed a complex process that requires a carefully balanced medium composition and tight regulation of the culture conditions. However, the high cost of these components may limit their use in many laboratories.

4.3.1. Hormones and growth factors

Folliculogenesis is a complex phenomenon in which several intra and extra ovarian factors act to maintain the development of follicles. The concentration, corresponding receptors, and balance between these factors are stage-specific and vary between follicular compartments and species [2,16,95]. Therefore, exploring the follicular requirements and supplementing the in vitro culture medium with those substances could improve in vitro growth of sheep PFs. The following sections will describe only the hormones and growth factors that have been used in the in vitro culture of late secondary follicles or EAFs in sheep.

4.3.2. Gonadotrophin hormone (FSH and LH)

PFs development in sheep is largely independent on gonadotropin stimulation [15]. The presence of FSH receptors in the PFs may explain some biological roles of this hormone in folliculogenesis [96]. FSH stimulates granulosa cell growth and proliferation, induces antrum formation [97], improves oocyte growth, survival of secondary follicles, mitochondrial activity, oocyte maturation [16] and stimulate intense DNA synthesis [47]. Also, this hormone interacts with other hormones (such as IGF-1) to support granulosa cell differentiation and function [98].

In sheep, researchers have used different concentrations of FSH to support in vitro development of late secondary and EAFs (Table 1). However, Tamilmani et al., (2005) reported that FSH concentration above 2 µg/ml is toxic for sheep PFs. This difference could be due either to the variation in size of PFs, source of hormone (recombinant or purified form), the origin of the FSH (human, ovine, bovine, rat, or porcine), and other factors in the culture medium [13]. Conversely, luteinizing hormone (LH) as the other member of gonadotropin hormones does not have receptors until the preantral stages (15) and has a negative effect on in vitro production of sheep PFs [15,99]. However, recently Reddy et al., (2021), indicated that supplementation of LH during the first two days (0-2 days) of culture increased follicle diameter, antrum formation, and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

IVM rate. These controversial reports may indicate that probably normal follicle development needs stage-specific hormone supplementation.

4.3.3. Growth hormone (GH)

GH is produced and secreted by the pituitary, gonads, uterus, placenta, and mammary glands and binds to its receptors in ovarian granulosa, theca, oocytes, and cumulus cells [100]. In sheep, it has been shown that supplementation of GH to culture media, independently or in combination with the other substances (IGF-I, T4, and FSH) can influence optimal follicular development, survival, increase antrum formation, meiosis resumption, and oocytes maturation [16,21]. Furthermore, GH can improve mitochondria activity and subsequently the quality of oocytes and fertilization rate [101]. Due to this, several researchers suggested 1mIU/ml of GH (Table 1) as the best concentration to support in vitro development of sheep EAFs [16,90,102,103].

4.3.4. Thyroxin (T4)

It is widely acknowledged that T4 has a significant impact on ovarian folliculogenesis [104]. Studies conducted on sheep have demonstrated that T4 can enhance in vitro development, meiotic competence, survival, and ultrastructural integrity of PFs [90,99,105]. Notably, the magnitude of these effects is size-dependent, with larger PFs exhibiting a more substantial response to T4 [16]. Based on this, it is reasonable to assume that T4 would also have comparable effects on EAFs (350-500µm).

Previous research by Arunakumari et al. (2007) has shown that T4 can support the maturation of oocytes from cultured large PFs (250-400µm) to the MII stage, although only in a small proportion of cases (Table 1). Furthermore, when T4 is combined with FSH, it supports better in vitro growth, antrum development, and subsequent maturation of oocytes to the MII stage in these PFs.

Given the synergistic effects of T4, FSH, IGF-I, and GH on the growth rate, antrum formation, and follicle diameter [99], it is worth considering the potential of T4 for promoting the in vitro development of sheep EAFs.

4.3.5. Estradiol-17β

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

Estradiol has specific intracellular receptors which are expressed in the granulosa cells [106]. The limited studies on in vitro culture of EAFs in cows and pigs showed some positive effects of this hormone on meiotic and developmental competence of oocytes, cumulus-expansion, and cumulus-oocyte integrity [11,107]. There is no report on the effects of this hormone on in vitro culture of sheep EAFs. However, recent studies on the late secondary follicles suggested that estradiol promotes follicle growth [90], antrum formation [17], nuclear maturation [90], and inhibits follicle atresia by reducing the oxidative stress [17,108].

In this context, Reddy et al., (2021) indicated that the supplementation of LH and estradiol (5 ng/ml- Table 1) during the first two days of follicle culture supported a better average increase in diameter and antrum formation. Furthermore, the isolated oocytes at the end of the culture showed a higher in vitro maturation rate.

4.3.6. Leptin

Leptin regulates nutritional status and energy sufficiency in all stages of the ovarian follicle by binding to its receptors in the oocytes and cumulus cells [109,110]. Moreover, it participates in regulation of ovarian folliculogenesis indirectly via control of luteinizing hormone and FSH secretion [111].

It has been suggested that supplementation of medium with the physiological concentration of leptin in plasma (0.5-2 ng/mL) could be sufficient to support the in vitro development of sheep EAFs, while the higher concentrations (10ng/ml and 25ng/ml for 300-450µm and 240–270µm, respectively- Table 1) were recommended for the smaller follicles [102,109,110]. In sheep leptin supplementation to EAFs culture medium has been shown to promote follicular development, stimulate its receptor expression [102,109], improve meiotic resumption, follicular survival, antrum formation, oocyte growth, attenuating mitochondrial dysfunction and oxidative stress [31,110].

4.3.7. Melatonin

Sheep follicular fluid contains melatonin derived from blood and self-secretion which increases with follicle size [112]. It has been reported that supplementation of 500-1000 pg/ml melatonin in the culture medium of sheep EAFs stimulates antral cavity formation, enhances the development of secondary and early antral follicles, increases mitochondrial activity and percentage of fully grown

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

oocytes [18]. Moreover, it acts not only as a hormone but also as an efficient antioxidant that can enhance the development and decreases ROS levels of oocytes from in vitro-grown EAFs [18,113]

4.3.8. Insulin-like growth factor-I (IGF- I)

IGF-I plays an essential role in the proliferation and differentiation of granulosa cells and ovarian response to FSH action [114,115]. In sheep, it has been detected in the oocytes and granulosa cells at all follicular stages and acts as a stimulatory growth factor [116]. It can increase follicular diameter, oocyte maturation rates, antrum formation, cell proliferation, and reduce follicular atresia and DNA fragmentation [16,116,117]. It also has a synergic effect with GH, T4, and FSH on follicle and oocyte development in sheep [16,116]. Therefore, IGF-1 appears to be among the most important growth, differentiation and survival factors which can protect granulosa cells from apoptosis and supports cell differentiation and function [98].

4.3.9. Transforming growth factors (TGF- α and TGF- β)

The TGF family has two main members (TGF- β and TGF- α) with a wide range of biological activities related to cell proliferation and differentiation depending on the cell type and growth factor environment [118]. In sheep, TGF- β has been reported to be produced in the ovarian theca cells at all follicular stages and affects luteinizing granulosa cells [119]. However, its effects on the in vitro development of late secondary follicles (250-400 μ m) and oocyte development are inconsistent [16]. These results may be related to the presence of other components and growth factors in the medium, as the inhibitory effect of the TGF- β can be attenuated by the simultaneous presence of IGF-I [16].

TGF- α , another member of the transforming growth factor was reported to induce (2.5ng/ml) in vitro growth of late secondary follicles (250-400 μ m), new DNA synthesis, increase follicle size, antrum formation, and meiotic maturation [15,47].

4.3.10. Growth differentiation factor- 9 (GDF-9)

In the sheep ovary, GDF-9 has been found to be expressed in all follicular categories indicating its direct involvement in folliculogenesis, oocyte growth and meiotic resumption [38,120,121]. However, the effects on follicular survival and apoptosis are controversial [116,122].

1
2
3
3⁴89
5

3⁶90 **4.3.11. Fibroblast growth factor 2 (FGF-2)**

7
8
3₉91 FGF-2 is a member of the fibroblast growth factors family [123]. In sheep, it is produced in PFs and
1₃0₂ granulosa cells of secondary and antral follicles [124]. Therefore, it may have an important role in
11
13₂93 the regulation of PFs development including DNA synthesis, antrum formation, and nuclear
13
13₄94 maturation of the oocytes in the cultured follicles [125,126]. Also, it has positive effects on cell
15
13₆95 proliferation, in vitro growth of PFs, and decrease apoptosis [124,127]. It has been indicated that 10
17
13₈96 and 50 ng/ml of FGF-2 as the minimum and toxic concentrations for in vitro culture of sheep PFs,
19
3₉7 respectively [90]. However, further research needs to be done to indicate the optimum dose for
20
23₉8 improving nuclear maturation in the sheep PFs.
22
23

24
23
24
25

24⁶00 **4.3.12. Epidermal growth factor (EGF)**

27
24₈01 Immunostaining studies of sheep oocytes and granulosa cells confirmed the presence of EGF
29
34₀02 protein in all follicular stages [124]. However, during the transition from secondary to antral follicle
31
34₂03 stage a reduction in the EGF production by the granulosa cells was reported [124]. The EGF is
33
34₄04 involved in the regulation of several ovarian processes and the maintenance of normal
35
34₆05 ultrastructural characteristics of sheep follicles [91].
37

38
34₇06 Previous research in sheep revealed that adding EGF to the culture medium can improve in vitro
39
40₇ survival [128], stimulate follicle growth, induce DNA synthesis [47] and an increase in oocyte
40
44₀8 diameter [91]. Despite of these benefits, the oocytes cultured with EGF (50ng/ml) are unable to
42
44₃09 reach the MII stage [15,124]. These results suggest that EGF might initiate the growth of sheep PFs,
44
44₅10 but requires other factors to sustain or complete the process [15,47].
46

47
48
49
44₉12
50
44₁13

51 54²14 **4.3.13. Leukemia inhibitory factor (LIF)**

53
54
54₅15 The LIF is an important cytokine in sheep folliculogenesis which can affect cell survival,
56
54₇16 proliferation, or differentiation depending on the cellular context [129,130]. It has been shown that
58
54₉17 the levels of LIF in the follicular fluid increase progressively during follicular development and
60

61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56

influence oocyte growth, maintenance of follicular viability [131], and modulated the differentiation of granulosa cells [130]. Also, when associated with FSH, LIF increases antrum formation [131], expression of genes involved in the oocyte-granulosa dialogue, modulates the effects of culture on follicle development, and improves oocyte meiotic competence [130]. On contrary, Cadoret et al (2021) did not show a significant change in follicle growth, antrum formation, and follicle survival in sheep. Also, compared to the previous report, they showed a higher maturation rate for oocytes derived from in vitro culture of PFs (200µm<) in the presence of 50 ng/mL LIF (56% vs 29%) [131]. The discrepancy may be due to differences between the culture systems, including the origin of FSH or LIF [130].

5. Antioxidant

Sheep oocytes contain a high level of lipid microdroplets (about 89 ng) including saturated fatty acids (45–55% of total fatty acids in oocytes) and monounsaturated fatty acids (MUFA: 27–34%) or PUFA (11–21%) [132,133].

The combination of this characteristic and physical stress during in vitro culture makes sheep oocytes susceptible to oxidative stress and interrupts the balance between pro- and anti-apoptotic factors [134,135]. Consequently, they can negatively affect meiotic spindle formation, oocyte maturation [136,137], and follicle development [12].

Due to this, a great variety of antioxidants such as ascorbic acid, transferrin, selenium, Gallic acid [55], coenzyme Q10 [138], rutin [139], kaempferol [140], protocatechuic acid [141] melatonin and insulin [18] have been tested to diminish the negative effects of oxidative stress in sheep follicle culture (Table 1). Regardless of whether they are used alone or in combination with other antioxidants, they improved follicular development by promoting granulosa cell viability, maintaining follicle morphology, and inhibiting apoptosis [139]. Altogether, adding the antioxidants at an appropriate concentration/combination is needed to reduce oxidative stress during long-term in vitro culture of follicles [34].

6. Challenges and prospective

1
2
3
4
46
5
47
7
48
9
49
11
50
12
51
14
52
16
53
18
54
20
55
22
56
23
57
25
58
27
59
29
60
31
61
33
62
34
63
36
64
37
38
65
40
66
42
67
44
68
45
69
47
70
49
71
51
72
53
73
55
74
56
75
58
76
60
61
62
63
64
65

In vitro culture of EAFs is a promising approach for fertility preservation and assisted reproductive technologies. However, several challenges must be addressed before this technique can be applied. One of the main challenges is related to the limited number of retrievable follicles (5-10/ovary). The population of EAFs can be affected by various factors, such as donor age, nutrition, season, and reproductive stage, making it difficult to predict the number of retrievable EAFs within each ovary. The current methods for isolating EAFs are also labor-intensive and have a low recovery rate [52]. In addition, since oocyte diameter is not directly proportional to follicular size [142], the variation in the reported size of EAFs may also affect the in vitro culture outputs (Table 1). Therefore, the proper identification of the developmental stage of isolated EAFs, and its relation to oocyte maturation stage, will greatly enhance current fertility preservation strategies. Furthermore, providing adequate nutrients and creating an optimal environment for EAFs is challenging. Sheep EAFs are relatively large (350-500µm), which may restrict the diffusion of oxygen and nutrients and limit their ability to reach the follicle core [65]. The in vitro culture system must also provide sufficient support to retain the spherical shape of the follicles and supply various nutrients, antioxidants, hormones, and growth factors in the best concentration, combination and timing [13,39,40]. Additionally, the effect of the in vitro culture medium and environment on the epigenetic changes should be considered since the oocytes acquire their epigenome during their growth [34,59]. Despite these challenges, exploring novel isolation methods combined with bioengineering technology, such as microfluidic technology [143], and supplementation of medium with predefined substances (e.g. antioxidants), signaling molecules (e.g. exosomes and hormones), and co-culturing with the somatic cells (cumulus or granulosa cells) hold immense promise for advancing this field and improving outcomes [41,60,144,145].

7. Conclusion

In vitro culture of EAFs will probably become a key strategy for the preservation of fertility in mammals in the future. Accordingly, it is being developed as a new method for increasing the availability of competent oocytes. However, designing a suitable culture system is complicated as several parameters should be consider to preserve oocyte quality while supporting the growth and architecture. For example, several factors that contribute to follicular development are still unclear, such as the type of culture medium, hormones, and growth factors to be used and the ratio of each.

1
2
3
4
477
5
478
7
479
9
1480
11
1481
13
1482
14
1483
16
1484
18
1485
20
1486
22
1487
23
1488
25
1489
27
1490
29
1491
31
1492
33
1493
35
1494
37
1495
39
1496
41
1497
42
1498
44
1499
46
1500
48
1501
50
1502
51
1503
52
53
1504
55
1505
57
1506
59
1507
61
62
63
64
65

In this regard, other factors such as season, nutrition, age, and follicular requirements which seem to be stage-specific and species-specific should be considered. Overall, the results are promising but more research is needed to develop or introduce a new follicle isolation method, in vitro culture systems (2D or 3D, single or co-culture) and other signaling factors.

Funding

This research was funded by the Italian Ministry for research and Education (MUR) under the program PRIN 2020 - project InfinitEGG - New perspectives for the exploitation of female reproductive potential in mammals: from the recovery of the untapped natural ovarian reserve to the generation of oocytes and granulosa cells from mesenchymal stem cells (20209L8BN4).

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

CRedit authorship contribution statement

Mohammadreza Ebrahimi: search strategy, studies reviewed, writing – original draft, wrote the manuscript. **Maria Dattena:** writing- reviewing and editing, and approved the final version of the manuscript. **Alberto Maria Luciano:** designed the study, reviewed studies, and contributed to the original draft writing. **Sara Succu:** writing- reviewing and editing. **Sergio Domenico Gadau:** writing- reviewing and editing. **Laura Mara:** writing- reviewing and editing. **Fabrizio Chessa:** writing- reviewing and editing. **Fiammetta Berlinguer:** designed the study, conducted the search strategy, reviewed studies, contributed to the original draft writing, and approved the final version of the manuscript.

References:

1
2
3
5408
5509
5610
5711
5812
5913
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
61
62
63
64
65

[1] Cahill LP, Mauleon P. A study of the population of primordial and small follicles in the sheep. *Reproduction* 1981;61:201–6.

[2] de Figueiredo JR, de Lima LF, Silva JRV, Santos RR. Control of growth and development of preantral follicle: insights from in vitro culture. *Anim Reprod* 2018;15:648–59.

[3] Telfer EE, Andersen CY. In vitro growth and maturation of primordial follicles and immature oocytes. *Fertil Steril* 2021;115:1116–25.

[4] Luciano AM, Barros RG, Soares ACS, Buratini J, Lodde V, Franciosi F. Recreating the follicular environment: a customized approach for in vitro culture of bovine oocytes based on the origin and differentiation state. *Next Gener. Cult. Platforms Reliab. Vitro. Model.*, Springer; 2021, p. 1–15.

[5] Luciano AM, Franciosi F, Modina SC, Lodde V. Gap Junction-Mediated Communications Regulate Chromatin Remodeling During Bovine Oocyte Growth and Differentiation Through cAMP-Dependent Mechanism(s). *Biol Reprod* 2011;85:1252–9. <https://doi.org/10.1095/biolreprod.111.092858>.

[6] Alam MH, Lee J, Miyano T. Inhibition of PDE3A sustains meiotic arrest and gap junction of bovine growing oocytes in in vitro growth culture. *Theriogenology* 2018;118:110–8. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.theriogenology.2018.05.028>.

[7] Garcia Barros R, Lodde V, Franciosi F, Luciano AM. A refined culture system of oocytes from early antral follicles promotes oocyte maturation and embryo development in cattle. *Reproduction* 2022. <https://doi.org/10.1530/REP-22-0277>.

[8] Kawano K, Sakaguchi K, Madalitso C, Ninpetch N, Kobayashi S, Furukawa E, et al. Effect of heat exposure on the growth and developmental competence of bovine oocytes derived from early antral follicles. *Sci Rep* 2022;12:1–14.

[9] Cadenas J, Maside C, Ferreira ACA, Vieira LA, Leiva-Revilla J, Paes VM, et al. Relationship between follicular dynamics and oocyte maturation during in vitro culture as a non-invasive sign of caprine oocyte meiotic competence. *Theriogenology* 2018;107:95–103. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.theriogenology.2017.10.038>.

[10] Cayo-Colca IS, Yamagami Y, Phan T-C, Miyano T. A combination of FSH and dibutyl cyclic AMP promote growth and acquisition of meiotic competence of oocytes from early porcine antral follicles. *Theriogenology* 2011;75:1602–12. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.theriogenology.2010.12.023>.

[11] Kubo N, Cayo- Colca IS, Miyano T. Effect of estradiol- 17 β during in vitro growth culture on the growth, maturation, cumulus expansion and development of porcine oocytes from early antral follicles. *Anim Sci J* 2015;86:251–9.

[12] de Sá NAR, Ferreira ACA, Sousa FGC, Duarte ABG, Paes VM, Cadenas J, et al. First pregnancy after in vitro culture of early antral follicles in goats: positive effects of anethole on follicle development and steroidogenesis. *Mol Reprod Dev* 2020;87:966–77.

[13] Cecconi S, Barboni B, Coccia M, Mattioli M. In vitro development of sheep preantral follicles. *Biol Reprod* 1999;60:594–601.

[14] Chelikani PK, Amarnath D, Reddy KK, Naidu KS, Rao K V, Rao VH. Isolation of preantral ovarian follicles in sheep and goats. *Theriogenology* 1998;1:343.

[15] Tamilmani G, Rao BS, Vagdevi R, Amarnath D, Naik BR, Mutharao M, et al. Nuclear maturation of ovine oocytes in cultured preantral follicles. *Small Rumin Res* 2005;60:295–305.

[16] Arunakumari G, Shanmugasundaram N, Rao VH. Development of morulae from the oocytes of cultured sheep preantral follicles. *Theriogenology* 2010;74:884–94.

[17] Reddy LSS, Naik BR, Sivakumar AVN, Punyakumari B, Suresh J. Effect of LH and Estradiol-17 β Supplementation at Different Time Points on In vitro Development of Preantral Follicles in Sheep. *Indian J Anim Res* 2021;1:6.

[18] Barros VRP, Monte APO, Santos JMS, Lins T, Cavalcante AYP, Gouveia BB, et al. Melatonin improves development, mitochondrial function and promotes the meiotic resumption of sheep oocytes from in vitro grown secondary follicles. *Theriogenology* 2020;144:67–73.

[19] Rossetto R, Saraiva MVA, dos Santos RR, da Silva CMG, Faustino LR, Chaves RN, et al. Effect of medium composition on the in vitro culture of bovine pre-antral follicles: morphology and viability do not guarantee functionality. *Zygote* 2013;21:125–8.

[20] Figueiredo JR, Hulshof SCJ, Van den Hurk R, Nussgens B, Bevers MM, Ectors FJ, et al. Preservation of oocyte and granulosa cell morphology in bovine preantral follicles cultured in vitro. *Theriogenology* 1994;41:1333–46.

[21] Magalhães DM, Fernandes DD, Mororó MBS, Silva CMG, Rodrigues GQ, Bruno JB, et al. Effect of the medium replacement interval on the viability, growth and in vitro maturation of isolated caprine and ovine pre- antral follicles. *Reprod Domest Anim* 2011;46:134–40.

[22] Wrenzycki C, Stinshoff H. Maturation environment and impact on subsequent developmental competence of bovine oocytes. *Reprod Domest Anim* 2013;48:38–43.

[23] Guzel Y, Oktem O. Understanding follicle growth in vitro: Are we getting closer to obtaining mature oocytes from in vitro- grown follicles in human? *Mol Reprod Dev* 2017;84:544–59.

[24] Arav A, Revel A, Nathan Y, Bor A, Gacitua H, Yavin S, et al. Oocyte recovery, embryo development and ovarian function after cryopreservation and transplantation of whole sheep ovary. *Hum Reprod* 2005;20:3554–9.

[25] Juengel JL, Sawyer HR, Smith PR, Quirke LD, Heath DA, Lun S, et al. Origins of follicular cells and ontogeny of steroidogenesis in ovine fetal ovaries. *Mol Cell Endocrinol* 2002;191:1–10.

[26] Torres-Rovira L, Gonzalez-Bulnes A, Succu S, Spezzigu A, Manca ME, Leoni GG, et al. Predictive value of antral follicle count and anti-Müllerian hormone for follicle and oocyte developmental competence during the early prepubertal period in a sheep model. *Reprod Fertil Dev* 2014;26:1094–106.

[27] Lundy T, Smith P, O’connell A, Hudson NL, McNatty KP. Populations of granulosa cells in small follicles of the sheep ovary. *Reproduction* 1999;115:251–62.

1
2
3
5470
5571
5672
5773
5874
5975
6076
6177
6278
6379
6480
6581
6682
6783
6884
6985
7086
7187
7288
7389
7490
7591
7692
7793
7894
7995
8096
8197
8298
8399
8400
8501
8602
8703
8804
8905
9006
9107
9208
9309
9410
9511
9612
9713
9814
9915
10016
10117
10218
10319
10420
10521
10622
10723
10824
10925
11026
11127
11228
11329
11430
11531
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165

[28] Scaramuzzi RJ, Adams NR, Baird DT, Campbell BK, Downing JA, Findlay JK, et al. A model for follicle selection and the determination of ovulation rate in the ewe. *Reprod Fertil Dev* 1993;5:459–78.

[29] Freitas C, Neto AC, Matos L, Silva E, Ribeiro Â, Silva-Carvalho JL, et al. Follicular Fluid redox involvement for ovarian follicle growth. *J Ovarian Res* 2017;10:1–10.

[30] Gosden RG, Byatt-Smith JG. Oxygen concentration gradient across the ovarian follicular epithelium: model, predictions and implications. *Hum Reprod* 1986;1:65–8.

[31] Menezes VG, Monte APO, Gouveia BB, Lins T, Donfack NJ, Macedo TJS, et al. Effects of leptin on the follicular development and mitochondrial activity of ovine isolated early antral follicles cultured in vitro. *Theriogenology* 2019;138:77–83.

[32] Cran DG, Moor RM, Hay MF. Fine structure of the sheep oocyte during antral follicle development. *Reproduction* 1980;59:125–32.

[33] Andrade GM, Collado M del, Meirelles FV, Silveira JC da, Perecin F. Intrafollicular barriers and cellular interactions during ovarian follicle development. *Anim Reprod* 2019;16:485–96.

[34] Paulino LRFM, de Assis EIT, Azevedo VAN, Silva BR, da Cunha E V, Silva JR V. Why Is It So Difficult To Have Competent Oocytes from In vitro Cultured Preantral Follicles? *Reprod Sci* 2022:1–14.

[35] Russo V, Martelli M, Mauro A, Di Giacinto O, Nardinocchi D, Berardinelli P. Nuclear remodelling in growing oocytes of sheep. *Vet Res Commun* 2007;31:201.

[36] Cocero MJ, Marigorta P, Novillo F, Folch J, Sánchez P, Alabart JL, et al. Ovine oocytes display a similar germinal vesicle configuration and global DNA methylation at prepubertal and adult ages. *Theriogenology* 2019;138:154–63.

[37] Bonnet A, Servin B, Mulsant P, Mandon-Pepin B. Spatio-temporal gene expression profiling during in vivo early ovarian folliculogenesis: integrated transcriptomic study and molecular signature of early follicular growth. *PLoS One* 2015;10:e0141482.

[38] Kona SSR, Chakravarthi VP, Kumar AVNS, Srividya D, Padmaja K, Rao VH. Quantitative expression patterns of GDF9 and BMP15 genes in sheep ovarian follicles grown in vivo or cultured in vitro. *Theriogenology* 2016;85:315–22.

[39] Cahill LP, Mauleon P. Influences of season, cycle and breed on follicular growth rates in sheep. *Reproduction* 1980;58:321–8.

[40] Bartlewski PM, Baby TE, Giffin JL. Reproductive cycles in sheep. *Anim Reprod Sci* 2011;124:259–68.

[41] Pathipati D, Prasad CHS, Kumar AVNS, Punya B, Kumari R V, Naik BR, et al. Effect of co-culture of sheep preantral follicles with ovarian somatic cells (cumulus cells and granulosa cells) 2019.

[42] Araújo VR, Gastal MO, Figueiredo JR, Gastal EL. In vitro culture of bovine preantral follicles: a review. *Reprod Biol Endocrinol* 2014;12:1–14.

[43] Amorim CA, Lucci CM, Rodrigues APR, Carvalho FCA, Figueiredo JR de, Rondina D, et al. Quantitative and qualitative analysis of the effectiveness of a mechanical method for the isolation of preantral follicles from ovine ovaries. *Theriogenology* 2000;53:1251–62.

[44] Campos LB, Praxedes ECG, Saraiva MVA, Comizzoli P, Silva AR. Advances and challenges of using ovarian preantral follicles to develop biobanks of wild mammals. *Biopreserv Biobank* 2019;17:334–41.

[45] Gastal EL, Aguiar FLN, Gastal GDA, Alves KA, Alves BG, Figueiredo JR. Harvesting, processing, and evaluation of in vitro-manipulated equine preantral follicles: A review. *Theriogenology* 2020;156:283–95.

[46] Gupta PSP, Ramesh HS, Manjunatha BM, Nandi S, Ravindra JP. Production of buffalo embryos using oocytes from in vitro grown preantral follicles. *Zygote* 2008;16:57–63.

[47] Hemamalini NC, Rao BS, Tamilmani G, Amarnath D, Vagdevi R, Naidu KS, et al. Influence of transforming growth factor- α , insulin-like growth factor-II, epidermal growth factor or follicle stimulating hormone on in vitro development of preantral follicles in sheep. *Small Rumin Res* 2003;50:11–22.

[48] Wandji S-A, Sršeň V, Voss AK, Eppig JJ, Fortune JE. Initiation in vitro of growth of bovine primordial follicles. *Biol Reprod* 1996;55:942–8.

[49] Nicosia S V, Evangelista I, Batta SK. Rabbit ovarian follicles. I. Isolation technique and characterization at different stages of development. *Biol Reprod* 1975;13:423–47.

[50] Dufour J, Cahill LP, Mauleon P. Short-and long-term effects of hypophysectomy and unilateral ovariectomy on ovarian follicular populations in sheep. *Reproduction* 1979;57:301–9.

[51] Driancourt M, Cahill LP, Bindon BM. Ovarian follicular populations and preovulatory enlargement in Booroola and control Merino ewes. *Reproduction* 1985;73:93–107.

[52] Lucci CM, Amorim CA, Rodrigues APR, Figueiredo JR de, Bão SN, Silva JRV da, et al. Study of preantral follicle population in situ and after mechanical isolation from caprine ovaries at different reproductive stages. *Anim Reprod Sci* 1999;56:223–36.

[53] Chakravarthi VP, Kona SSR, Kumar AVNS, Bhaskar M, Rao VH. Quantitative expression of antiapoptotic and proapoptotic genes in sheep ovarian follicles grown in vivo or cultured in vitro. *Theriogenology* 2015;83:590–5.

[54] Jamil H, Samad HA, Qureshi ZI, Rehman NU, Lodhi LA. Harvesting and evaluation of riverine buffalo follicular oocytes. *Turkish J Vet Anim Sci* 2008;32:25–30.

[55] Silva RF, Lima LF, Rocha RMP, Brito IR, Silva GM, Correia HH V, et al. In vitro long-term culture of isolated ovine preantral follicles: Influence of ethanol on steroid production, oocyte meiotic resumption, and metabolomic profile. *Res Vet Sci* 2021;135:432–41.

[56] He Y, Meng K, Wang X, Dong Z, Zhang Y, Quan F. Comparison of bovine small antral follicle development in two-and

1
2
3
6432
6533
6634
6735
6836
6937
7038
7139
7240
7341
7442
7543
7644
7745
7846
7947
8048
8149
8250
8351
8452
8553
8654
8755
8856
8957
9058
9159
9260
9361
9462
9563
9664
9765
9866
9967
10068
10169
10270
10371
10472
10573
10674
10775
10876
10977
11078
11179
11280
11381
11482
11583
11684
11785
11886
11987
12088
12189
12290
12391
12492
12593
12694
12795
12896
12997
13098
13199
132100
133101
134102
135103
136104
137105
138106
139107
140108
141109
142110
143111
144112
145113
146114
147115
148116
149117
150118
151119
152120
153121
154122
155123
156124
157125
158126
159127
160128
161129
162130
163131
164132
165133
166134
167135
168136
169137
170138
171139
172140
173141
174142
175143
176144
177145
178146
179147
180148
181149
182150
183151
184152
185153
186154
187155
188156
189157
190158
191159
192160
193161
194162
195163
196164
197165
198166
199167
200168
201169
202170
203171
204172
205173
206174
207175
208176
209177
210178
211179
212180
213181
214182
215183
216184
217185
218186
219187
220188
221189
222190
223191
224192
225193
226194
227195
228196
229197
230198
231199
232200
233201
234202
235203
236204
237205
238206
239207
240208
241209
242210
243211
244212
245213
246214
247215
248216
249217
250218
251219
252220
253221
254222
255223
256224
257225
258226
259227
260228
261229
262230
263231
264232
265233
266234
267235
268236
269237
270238
271239
272240
273241
274242
275243
276244
277245
278246
279247
280248
281249
282250
283251
284252
285253
286254
287255
288256
289257
290258
291259
292260
293261
294262
295263
296264
297265
298266
299267
300268
301269
302270
303271
304272
305273
306274
307275
308276
309277
310278
311279
312280
313281
314282
315283
316284
317285
318286
319287
320288
321289
322290
323291
324292
325293
326294
327295
328296
329297
330298
331299
332300
333301
334302
335303
336304
337305
338306
339307
340308
341309
342310
343311
344312
345313
346314
347315
348316
349317
350318
351319
352320
353321
354322
355323
356324
357325
358326
359327
360328
361329
362330
363331
364332
365333
366334
367335
368336
369337
370338
371339
372340
373341
374342
375343
376344
377345
378346
379347
380348
381349
382350
383351
384352
385353
386354
387355
388356
389357
390358
391359
392360
393361
394362
395363
396364
397365
398366
399367
400368
401369
402370
403371
404372
405373
406374
407375
408376
409377
410378
411379
412380
413381
414382
415383
416384
417385
418386
419387
420388
421389
422390
423391
424392
425393
426394
427395
428396
429397
430398
431399
432400
433401
434402
435403
436404
437405
438406
439407
440408
441409
442410
443411
444412
445413
446414
447415
448416
449417
450418
451419
452420
453421
454422
455423
456424
457425
458426
459427
460428
461429
462430
463431
464432
465433
466434
467435
468436
469437
470438
471439
472440
473441
474442
475443
476444
477445
478446
479447
480448
481449
482450
483451
484452
485453
486454
487455
488456
489457
490458
491459
492460
493461
494462
495463
496464
497465
498466
499467
500468
501469
502470
503471
504472
505473
506474
507475
508476
509477
510478
511479
512480
513481
514482
515483
516484
517485
518486
519487
520488
521489
522490
523491
524492
525493
526494
527495
528496
529497
530498
531499
532500
533501
534502
535503
536504
537505
538506
539507
540508
541509
542510
543511
544512
545513
546514
547515
548516
549517
550518
551519
552520
553521
554522
555523
556524
557525
558526
559527
560528
561529
562530
563531
564532
565533
566534
567535
568536
569537
570538
571539
572540
573541
574542
575543
576544
577545
578546
579547
580548
581549
582550
583551
584552
585553
586554
587555
588556
589557
590558
591559
592560
593561
594562
595563
596564
597565
598566
599567
600568
601569
602570
603571
604572
605573
606574
607575
608576
609577
610578
611579
612580
613581
614582
615583
616584
617585
618586
619587
620588
621589
622590
623591
624592
625593
626594
627595
628596
629597
630598
631599
632600
633601
634602
635603
636604
637605
638606
639607
640608
641609
642610
643611
644612
645613
646614
647615
648616
649617
650618
651619
652620
653621
654622
655623
656624
657625
658626
659627
660628
661629
662630
663631
664632
665633
666634
667635
668636
669637
670638
671639
672640
673641
674642
675643
676644
677645
678646
679647
680648
681649
682650
683651
684652
685653
686654
687655
688656
689657
690658
691659
692660
693661
694662
695663
696664
697665
698666
699667
700668
701669
702670
703671
704672
705673
706674
707675
708676
709677
710678
711679
712680
713681
714682
715683
716684
717685
718686
719687
720688
721689
722690
723691
724692
725693
726694
727695
728696
729697
730698
731699
732700
733701
734702
735703
736704
737705
738706
739707
740708
741709
742710
743711
744712
745713
746714
747715
748716
749717
750718
751719
752720
753721
754722
755723
756724
757725
758726
759727
760728
761729
762730
763731
764732
765733
766734
767735
768736
769737
770738
771739
772740
773741
774742
775743
776744
777745
778746
779747
780748
781749
782750
783751
784752
785753
786754
787755
788756
789757
790758
791759
792760
793761
794762
795763
796764
797765
798766
799767
800768
801769
802770
803771
804772
805773
806774
807775
808776
809777
810778
811779
812780
813781
814782
815783
816784
817785
818786
819787
820788
821789
822790
823791
824792
825793
826794
827795
828796
829797
830798
831799
832800
833801
834802
835803
836804
837805
838806
839807
840808
841809
842810
843811
844812
845813
846814
847815
848816
849817
850818
851819
852820
853821
854822
855823
856824
857825
858826
859827
860828
861829
862830
863831
864832
865833
866834
867835
868836
869837
870838
871839
872840
873841
874842
875843
876844
877845
878846
879847
880848
881849
882850
883851
884852
885853
886854
887855
888856
889857
890858
891859
892860
893861
894862
895863
896864
897865
898866
899867
900868
901869
902870
903871
904872
905873
906874
907875
908876
909877
910878
911879
912880
913881
914882
915883
916884
917885
918886
919887
920888
921889
922890
923891
924892
925893
926894
927895
928896
929897
930898
931899
932900
933901
934902
935903
936904
937905
938906
939907
940908
941909
942910
943911
944912
945913
946914
947915
948916
949917
950918
951919
952920
953921
954922
955923
956924
957925
958926
959927
960928
961929
962930
963931
964932
965933
966934
967935
968936
969937
970938
971939
972940
973941
974942
975943
976944
977945
978946
979947
980948
981949
982950
983951
984952
985953
986954
987955
988956
989957
990958
991959
992960
993961
994962
995963
996964
997965
998966
999967
1000968

three-dimensional culture systems. *An Acad Bras Cienc* 2020;92.

[57] Simon LE, Kumar TR, Duncan FE. In vitro ovarian follicle growth: a comprehensive analysis of key protocol variables†. *Biol Reprod* 2020;103:455–70. <https://doi.org/10.1093/biolre/iaaa073>.

[58] Wycherley G, Downey D, Kane MT, Hynes AC. A novel follicle culture system markedly increases follicle volume, cell number and oestradiol secretion. *Reproduction* 2004;127:669–77.

[59] Barboni B, Russo V, Cecconi S, Curini V, Colosimo A, Garofalo MLA, et al. In vitro grown sheep preantral follicles yield oocytes with normal nuclear-epigenetic maturation. *PLoS One* 2011;6:e27550.

[60] Dadashzadeh A, Moghassemi S, Shavandi A, Amorim CA. A review on biomaterials for ovarian tissue engineering. *Acta Biomater* 2021;135:48–63.

[61] Oktem O, Oktay K. The role of extracellular matrix and activin-A in in vitro growth and survival of murine preantral follicles. *Reprod Sci* 2007;14:358–66.

[62] Heiligentag M, Eichenlaub-Ritter U. Preantral follicle culture and oocyte quality. *Reprod Fertil Dev* 2018;30:18–43.

[63] Telfer EE, Zelinski MB. Ovarian follicle culture: advances and challenges for human and nonhuman primates. *Fertil Steril* 2013;99:1523–33.

[64] Luo Y, Hong Y, Shen L, Wu F, Lin X. Multifunctional role of polyvinylpyrrolidone in pharmaceutical formulations. *AAPS PharmSciTech* 2021;22:1–16.

[65] Agarwal P, Choi JK, Huang H, Zhao S, Dumbleton J, Li J, et al. A biomimetic core-shell platform for miniaturized 3D cell and tissue engineering. *Part Part Syst Charact* 2015;32:809–16.

[66] Edmondson R, Broglie JJ, Adcock AF, Yang L. Three-dimensional cell culture systems and their applications in drug discovery and cell-based biosensors. *Assay Drug Dev Technol* 2014;12:207–18.

[67] Barros RG, Lodde V, Franciosi F, Luciano AM. In vitro culture strategy for oocytes from early antral follicle in cattle. *JoVE (Journal Vis Exp)* 2020:e61625.

[68] Huang W, Nagano M, Kang S-S, Yanagawa Y, Takahashi Y. Effects of in vitro growth culture duration and prematuration culture on maturational and developmental competences of bovine oocytes derived from early antral follicles. *Theriogenology* 2013;80:793–9.

[69] Barros RG, Lodde V, Franciosi F, Luciano AM. A refined culture system of oocytes from early antral follicles promotes oocyte maturation and embryo development in cattle. *Reproduction* 2023;165:221–33.

[70] Cadoret V, Frapsauce C, Jarrier P, Maillard V, Bonnet A, Locatelli Y, et al. Molecular evidence that follicle development is accelerated in vitro compared to in vivo. *Reproduction* 2017;153:493–508.

[71] Chelenga M, Sakaguchi K, Kawano K, Furukawa E, Yanagawa Y, Katagiri S, et al. Low oxygen environment and astaxanthin supplementation promote the developmental competence of bovine oocytes derived from early antral follicles during 8 days of in vitro growth in a gas-permeable culture device. *Theriogenology* 2022;177:116–26.

[72] Sánchez-Ajofrín I, Iniesta-Cuerda M, Sánchez-Calabuig MJ, Peris-Frau P, Martín-Maestro A, Ortiz JA, et al. Oxygen tension during in vitro oocyte maturation and fertilization affects embryo quality in sheep and deer. *Anim Reprod Sci* 2020;213:106279.

[73] Redding GP, Bronlund JE, Hart AL. Theoretical investigation into the dissolved oxygen levels in follicular fluid of the developing human follicle using mathematical modelling. *Reprod Fertil Dev* 2008;20:408–17.

[74] Place TL, Domann FE, Case AJ. Limitations of oxygen delivery to cells in culture: An underappreciated problem in basic and translational research. *Free Radic Biol Med* 2017;113:311–22.

[75] Araújo VR, Chaves RN, Duarte ABG, de Hollanda Celestino JJ, da Silva GM, Fernandes DD, et al. Effect of culture medium replacement protocol on the in vitro development of isolated caprine secondary follicles. *Small Rumin Res* 2011;95:139–43.

[76] Ebrahimi M, Mara L, Parham A, Dattena M. Mineral Oil for in vitro Embryo Production: What We Should Know? *Arch Razi Inst* 2022;77:1325–30.

[77] Blaschka C, Diers S, Aravina M, Geisler S, Schuler G, Tetens J. Evaluation of a small volume oil- free in vitro production system for bovine embryos. *Vet Med Sci* 2021;7:868–75.

[78] Yazdani M. Technical aspects of oxygen level regulation in primary cell cultures: A review. *Interdiscip Toxicol* 2016;9:85–9.

[79] Kito S, Iritani A, Bavister BD. Effects of volume, culture media and type of culture dish on in vitro development of hamster 1-cell embryos. *Theriogenology* 1997;47:541–8.

[80] Gutierrez CG, Ralph JH, Telfer EE, Wilmut I, Webb R. Growth and antrum formation of bovine preantral follicles in long-term culture in vitro. *Biol Reprod* 2000;62:1322–8.

[81] Telfer EE, McLaughlin M. In vitro development of ovarian follicles. *Semin. Reprod. Med.*, vol. 29, © Thieme Medical Publishers; 2011, p. 15–23.

[82] Lerman MJ, Lembong J, Muramoto S, Gillen G, Fisher JP. The evolution of polystyrene as a cell culture material. *Tissue Eng Part B Rev* 2018;24:359–72.

[83] Hirao Y, Itoh T, Shimizu M, Iga K, Aoyagi K, Kobayashi M, et al. In vitro growth and development of bovine oocyte-granulosa cell complexes on the flat substratum: effects of high polyvinylpyrrolidone concentration in culture medium. *Biol Reprod* 2004;70:83–91.

[84] Galdones E, Shea LD, Woodruff TK. Three-dimensional in vitro ovarian follicle culture. *Hum Assist Reprod Technol* 2011:167.

[85] Eppig JJ, Schroeder AC. Capacity of mouse oocytes from preantral follicles to undergo embryogenesis and development to

1
2
3
6494
6595
6696
6797
6898
6999
7000
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
61
62
63
64
65

live young after growth, maturation, and fertilization in vitro. *Biol Reprod* 1989;41:268–76.

[86] Cortvrintd R, Smitz J. In vitro follicle growth: achievements in mammalian species. *Reprod Domest Anim* 2001;36:3–9.

[87] Adam AAG, Takahashi Y, Katagiri S, Nagano M. In vitro culture of mouse preantral follicles using membrane inserts and developmental competence of in vitro ovulated oocytes. *J Reprod Dev* 2004;50:579–86.

[88] Ebrahimi MR, Mara L, Parham A, Dattena M. Reduced effect of mineral oil toxicity using four-well culture dish in sheep embryo production. *Small Rumin Res* 2020;191:106191. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.smallrumres.2020.106191>.

[89] Safrany ST, Karmustaji R, Mansoury M, Hamed M. The edge effect: a global problem-The trouble with culturing cells in 96-well plates. *Br. J. Pharmacol.*, vol. 176, WILEY 111 RIVER ST, HOBOKEN 07030-5774, NJ USA; 2019, p. 3045.

[90] Kona SSR, Kumar AVNS, Punyakumari B, Kumar RVS, Rao VH. Influence of TCM 199B, α -MEM, Waymouth MB 752/1 culture media, VEGF, Estradiol-17 β , GDF-9 and FGF on in vitro development of preantral follicles in sheep. *Vet Anim Sci* 2021;13:100189.

[91] Andrade PM, Chaves RN, Alves A, Rocha RMP, Lima LF, Carvalho AA, et al. Effects of α -MEM and TCM-199 culture media and epidermal growth factor on survival and growth of goat and sheep preantral follicles cultured in vitro. *Anim Reprod* 2018;11:567–72.

[92] Lane M, Gardner DK. Embryo culture medium: which is the best? *Best Pract Res Clin Obstet Gynaecol* 2007;21:83–100.

[93] Haag KT, Magalhães-Padilha DM, Fonseca GR, Wischral A, Gastal MO, King SS, et al. In vitro culture of equine preantral follicles obtained via the Biopsy Pick-Up method. *Theriogenology* 2013;79:911–7.

[94] de Figueiredo JR, Cadenas J, de Lima LF, Santos RR. Advances in in vitro folliculogenesis in domestic ruminants. *Anim Reprod* 2019;16:52.

[95] Price CA. Mechanisms of fibroblast growth factor signaling in the ovarian follicle. *J Endocrinol* 2016;228:R31–43.

[96] Tisdall DJ, Watanabe K, Hudson NL, Smith P, McNatty KP. FSH receptor gene expression during ovarian follicle development in sheep. *J Mol Endocrinol* 1995;15:273–81.

[97] Moore LG, Ng-Chie W, Lun S, Lawrence SB, Young W, McNatty KP. Follicle-stimulating hormone in the brushtail possum (*Trichosurus vulpecula*): purification, characterization, and radioimmunoassay. *Gen Comp Endocrinol* 1997;106:30–8.

[98] Baumgarten SC, Armouti M, Ko C, Stocco C. IGF1R expression in ovarian granulosa cells is essential for steroidogenesis, follicle survival, and fertility in female mice. *Endocrinology* 2017;158:2309–18.

[99] Arunakumari G, Vagdevi R, Rao BS, Naik BR, Naidu KS, Kumar RVS, et al. Effect of hormones and growth factors on in vitro development of sheep preantral follicles. *Small Rumin Res* 2007;70:93–100.

[100] Sirotkin A V. Control of reproductive processes by growth hormone: extra-and intracellular mechanisms. *Vet J* 2005;170:307–17.

[101] Weall BM, Al-Samerria S, Conceicao J, Yovich JL, Almahbobi G. A direct action for GH in improvement of oocyte quality in poor-responder patients. *Reproduction* 2015;149:147–54.

[102] Kamalamma P, Kona SSR, Chakravarthi VP, Kumar AVNS, Punyakumari B, Rao VH. Effect of leptin on in vitro development of ovine preantral ovarian follicles. *Theriogenology* 2016;85:224–9.

[103] Lakshminarayana BN V, Chakravarthi VP, Brahmaiah K V, Rao VH. Quantification of P450 aromatase gene expression in cultured and in vivo grown ovarian follicles in sheep. *Small Rumin Res* 2014;117:66–72.

[104] Silva JF, Ocarino NM, Serakides R. Thyroid hormones and female reproduction. *Biol Reprod* 2018;99:907–21.

[105] Costa SL da, Costa EP da, Pereira ECM, Gonçalves WG, Silva TF da, Queiroz VLD. HUMAN FOLLICLE STIMULATING HORMONE (hFSH) AND THYROXINE (T 4) IN SURVIVAL MAINTENANCE AND IN VITRO GROWTH PROMOTION OF CAPRINE PREANTRAL FOLLICLES. *Ciência Anim Bras* 2015;16:298–311.

[106] Tomic D, Frech MS, Babus JK, Symonds D, Furth PA, Koos RD, et al. Effects of ER α overexpression on female reproduction in mice. *Reprod Toxicol* 2007;23:317–25.

[107] Endo M, Kawahara-Miki R, Cao F, Kimura K, Kuwayama T, Monji Y, et al. Estradiol supports in vitro development of bovine early antral follicles. *Reproduction* 2013;145:85–96.

[108] Murdoch WJ, Van Kirk EA. Luteal dysfunction in ewes induced to ovulate early in the follicular phase. *Endocrinology* 1998;139:3480–4.

[109] Pragna KS, Kumar AVNS, Pathipati D, Naik BR, Kumari BP, Reddy LSSV. Characterization of Leptin receptor protein (LepR) expression in sheep ovarian follicles grown in vivo and cultured in vitro in different media 2021.

[110] Macedo TJS, Santos JMS, Bezerra MÉS, Menezes VG, Gouveia BB, Barbosa LMR, et al. Immunolocalization of leptin and its receptor in the sheep ovary and in vitro effect of leptin on follicular development and oocyte maturation. *Mol Cell Endocrinol* 2019;495:110506.

[111] Brannian JD, Hansen KA. Leptin and ovarian folliculogenesis: implications for ovulation induction and ART outcomes. *Semin. Reprod. Med.*, vol. 20, Copyright© 2002 by Thieme Medical Publishers, Inc., 333 Seventh Avenue, New ...; 2002, p. 103–12.

[112] Xiao L, Hu J, Song L, Zhang Y, Dong W, Jiang Y, et al. Profile of melatonin and its receptors and synthesizing enzymes in cumulus-oocyte complexes of the developing sheep antral follicle—a potential estradiol-mediated mechanism. *Reprod Biol Endocrinol* 2019;17:1–9.

[113] Barros VRP, Monte APO, Santos JMS, Lins T, Cavalcante AYP, Gouveia BB, et al. Effects of melatonin on the in vitro growth of early antral follicles and maturation of ovine oocytes. *Domest Anim Endocrinol* 2020;71:106386.

[114] Mazerbourg S, Monget P. Insulin-like growth factor binding proteins and IGFBP proteases: a dynamic system regulating the ovarian folliculogenesis. *Front Endocrinol (Lausanne)* 2018;9:134.

[115] Schams D, Berisha B, Kosmann M, Einspanier R, Amselgruber WM. Possible role of growth hormone, IGFs, and IGF-

1
2
3
7456
7557
7658
7759
7860
7961
8062
8163
8264
8365
8466
8567
8668
8769
8870
8971
9072
9173
9274
9375
9476
9577
9678
9779
9880
9981
10082
10183
10284
10385
10486
10587
10688
10789
10890
10991
11092
11193
11294
11395
11496
11597
11698
11799
11800
11901
12002
12103
12204
12305
12406
12507
12608
12709
12810
12911
13012
13113
13214
13315
13416
13517
13618
13719
13820
13921
14022

binding proteins in the regulation of ovarian function in large farm animals. *Domest Anim Endocrinol* 1999;17:279–85.

[116] Monte APO, Barros VRP, Santos JM, Menezes VG, Cavalcante AYP, Gouveia BB, et al. Immunohistochemical localization of insulin-like growth factor-1 (IGF-1) in the sheep ovary and the synergistic effect of IGF-1 and FSH on follicular development in vitro and LH receptor immunostaining. *Theriogenology* 2019;129:61–9.

[117] Bezerra MÉS, Barberino RS, Menezes VG, Gouveia BB, Macedo TJS, Santos JMS, et al. Insulin-like growth factor-1 (IGF-1) promotes primordial follicle growth and reduces DNA fragmentation through the phosphatidylinositol 3-kinase/protein kinase B (PI3K/AKT) signalling pathway. *Reprod Fertil Dev* 2018;30:1503–13.

[118] Partridge M, Green MR, Langdon JD, Feldmann M. Production of TGF- α and TGF- β by cultured keratinocytes, skin and oral squamous cell carcinomas—potential autocrine regulation of normal and malignant epithelial cell proliferation. *Br J Cancer* 1989;60:542–8.

[119] Juengel JL, Bibby AH, Reader KL, Lun S, Quirke LD, Haydon LJ, et al. The role of transforming growth factor-beta (TGF-beta) during ovarian follicular development in sheep. *Reprod Biol Endocrinol* 2004;2:1–11.

[120] Mery L, Lefevre A, Benchaib M, Demirci B, Salle B, Guerin J, et al. Follicular growth in vitro: detection of growth differentiation factor 9 (GDF9) and bone morphogenetic protein 15 (BMP15) during in vitro culture of ovine cortical slices. *Mol Reprod Dev Inc Gamete Res* 2007;74:767–74.

[121] Bodensteiner KJ, McNatty KP, Clay CM, Moeller CL, Sawyer HR. Expression of growth and differentiation factor-9 in the ovaries of fetal sheep homozygous or heterozygous for the Inverdale prolificacy gene (FecX I). *Biol Reprod* 2000;62:1479–85.

[122] Monte APO, Bezerra MÉS, Menezes VG, Gouveia BB, Barberino RS, Lins T, et al. Involvement of phosphorylated Akt and FOXO3a in the effects of Growth and Differentiation Factor-9 (GDF-9) on inhibition of follicular apoptosis and induction of granulosa cell proliferation after in vitro culture of sheep ovarian tissue. *Reprod Sci* 2021;28:2174–85.

[123] Chaves RN, de Matos MHT, Buratini J, de Figueiredo JR. The fibroblast growth factor family: involvement in the regulation of folliculogenesis. *Reprod Fertil Dev* 2012;24:905–15.

[124] Santos JMS, Menezes VG, Barberino RS, Macedo TJS, Lins TLB, Gouveia BB, et al. Immunohistochemical localization of fibroblast growth factor- 2 in the sheep ovary and its effects on pre- antral follicle apoptosis and development in vitro. *Reprod Domest Anim* 2014;49:522–8.

[125] Gupta PSP, Nandi S. Viability and growth of buffalo preantral follicles and their corresponding oocytes in vitro: Effect of growth factors and β mercaptoethanol. *Reprod Domest Anim* 2010;45:147–54.

[126] Roy SK, Greenwald GS. Methods of separation and in-vitro culture of pre-antral follicles from mammalian ovaries. *Hum Reprod Update* 1996;2:236–45.

[127] Vernon RK, Spicer LJ. Effects of basic fibroblast growth factor and heparin on follicle-stimulating hormone-induced steroidogenesis by bovine granulosa cells. *J Anim Sci* 1994;72:2696–702.

[128] Celestino JJH, Bruno JB, Lima-Verde IB, Matos MHT, Saraiva MVA, Chaves RN, et al. Recombinant epidermal growth factor maintains follicular ultrastructure and promotes the transition to primary follicles in caprine ovarian tissue cultured in vitro. *Reprod Sci* 2009;16:239–46.

[129] Nicola NA, Babon JJ. Leukemia inhibitory factor (LIF). *Cytokine Growth Factor Rev* 2015;26:533–44.

[130] Cadoret V, Jarrier-Gaillard P, Papillier P, Monniaux D, Guérif F, Dalbies-Tran R. Leukaemia inhibitory factor modulates the differentiation of granulosa cells during sheep in vitro preantral to antral follicle development and improves oocyte meiotic competence. *Mol Hum Reprod* 2021;27:gaab051.

[131] Luz VB, Santos RR, Araújo VR, Celestino JJH, Magalhães- Padilha DM, Chaves RN, et al. The effect of LIF in the absence or presence of FSH on the in vitro development of isolated caprine preantral follicles. *Reprod Domest Anim* 2012;47:379–84.

[132] Bradley J, Swann K. Mitochondria and lipid metabolism in mammalian oocytes and early embryos. *Int J Dev Biol* 2019;63:93–103.

[133] Dalbies-Tran R, Cadoret V, Desmarchais A, Elis S, Maillard V, Monget P, et al. A comparative analysis of oocyte development in mammals. *Cells* 2020;9:1002.

[134] Setroikromo R, Wierenga PK, Van Waarde M, Brunsting JF, Vellenga E, Kampinga HH. Heat shock proteins and Bcl-2 expression and function in relation to the differential hyperthermic sensitivity between leukemic and normal hematopoietic cells. *Cell Stress Chaperones* 2007;12:320.

[135] Agarwal A, Said TM, Bedaiwy MA, Banerjee J, Alvarez JG. Oxidative stress in an assisted reproductive techniques setting. *Fertil Steril* 2006;86:503–12.

[136] Tamura H, Takasaki A, Miwa I, Taniguchi K, Maekawa R, Asada H, et al. Oxidative stress impairs oocyte quality and melatonin protects oocytes from free radical damage and improves fertilization rate. *J Pineal Res* 2008;44:280–7.

[137] Choi MJ, Kim SC, Kim AN, Kwon HB, Ahn RS. Effect of endocrine disruptors on the oocyte maturation and ovulation in amphibians, *Rana dybowskii*. *Integr Biosci* 2007;11:1–8.

[138] Hosseinzadeh E, Zavareh S, Lashkarboluki T. Coenzyme Q10 Improves Developmental Competence of Mice Pre_antral Follicle Derived From Vitrified Ovary. *Arch Adv Biosci* 2015;6:65–71.

[139] Lins T, Cavalcante AYP, Santos JMS, Menezes VG, Barros VRP, Barberino RS, et al. Rutin can replace the use of three other antioxidants in the culture medium, maintaining the viability of sheep isolated secondary follicles. *Theriogenology* 2017;89:263–70.

[140] Santos JMS, Lins T, Barberino RS, Menezes VG, Gouveia BB, Matos MHT. Kaempferol promotes primordial follicle activation through the phosphatidylinositol 3- kinase/protein kinase B signaling pathway and reduces DNA fragmentation of

1
2
3
8418
8519
8620
8721
8822
8923
9024
9125
9226
9327
9428
9529
9630
9731
17
1832
19
2033
21
2234
23
2435
2536
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

sheep preantral follicles cultured in vitro. *Mol Reprod Dev* 2019;86:319–29.

[141] Menezes VG, Santos JMS, Macedo TJS, Lins T, Barberino RS, Gouveia BB, et al. Use of protocatechuic acid as the sole antioxidant in the base medium for in vitro culture of ovine isolated secondary follicles. *Reprod Domest Anim* 2017;52:890–8.

[142] Paramio M-T, Izquierdo D. Recent advances in in vitro embryo production in small ruminants. *Theriogenology* 2016;86:152–9.

[143] Desai N, Alex A, AbdelHafez F, Calabro A, Goldfarb J, Fleischman A, et al. Three-dimensional in vitro follicle growth: overview of culture models, biomaterials, design parameters and future directions. *Reprod Biol Endocrinol* 2010;8:1–12.

[144] Ishiguro A, Munakata Y, Shirasuna K, Kuwayama T, Iwata H. Addition of granulosa cells collected from differential follicle stages supports development of oocytes derived from porcine early antral follicles. *Reprod Med Biol* 2019;18:65–71.

[145] Sugiyama M, Sumiya M, Shirasuna K, Kuwayama T, Iwata H. Addition of granulosa cell mass to the culture medium of oocytes derived from early antral follicles increases oocyte growth, ATP content, and acetylation of H4K12. *Zygote* 2016;24:848–56.

Table 1: Overview of studies on in vitro culture of late secondary and EAFs in sheep																	
Source of ovaries	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	lamb	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep	Sheep
In vitro maturation results																	
Maturation rate ^a (%)	69 MII	29.63 MII	27.4 MII	56 MII	10.53 MII	31.5 MII	5.88 MII	~ 60 MII	16 MII	~ 38.8 MII	15 MII	14.29 MII	~ 20 MII	0 MII	7.15 MII	11 MII 30 MII	15 MII 55 MII
Culture conditions																	
Follicle diameter (µm)	250–300	>200	250 - 400	160-240	295-330	≥ 200	400-500	250 - 400	250 - 400	250–400	250–400	240- 260	300-450	200-230	200-233	150-250 251-400	150-250 250-400
Medium volume (µl)	100	100	20	100	100	100	100	20	80	20	-	100	100	100	100	10-20	20
Mineral oil	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	yes	Yes	-	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	yes	Yes
Concentration of gases	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2	5% Co2
Culture dish	60 mm plastic dishes	60 mm plastic dishes	35 mm plastic dishes	Petri dish	60 mm plastic dishes	60 mm plastic dishes	60 mm plastic dishes	35 mm plastic dishes	35 mm plastic dishes	35 mm plastic dishes	-	60 mm plastic dishes	60 mm plastic dishes	60 mm plastic dishes	60 mm plastic dishes	35 mm plastic dishes	35 mm plastic dishes
Culture system	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D	2D
Follicle isolation	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Enzymatic-mechanical	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection	Microdissection
Culture period (days)	18	18	6	20	18	18	12	6	6	6	6	12	12	12	12	6	6
Duration of medium replacement and volume	Every 2 days-60µl	Every 6 days-100µl	Every 6 days-10µl	Day 6 and 13-50µl	Every 2 days-60µl	Every 2 days-60µl	Every 2 days-60µl	Every 2 days-10µl	Every 2 days-40µl	Every 2 days-10µl	-	Every 2 days-60µl	Every 2 days-60µl	Every 2 days-60µl	Every 2 days-60µl	Only on day 3	-
Base culture medium	α-MEM	α-MEM	TCM 199	α-MEM	α-MEM	α-MEM	α-MEM	TCM199	TCM199	TCM199	TCM199	α-MEM	TCM199	α-MEM	α-MEM	TCM199	TCM199
Glutamine (mM)	2	2	-	2	2	2	2	-	-	-	-	2	2	2	2	-	-
Hypoxanthine (mM)	2	2	-	2	2	2	2	-	-	-	-	2	2	2	2	-	-
Hormones																	
Insulin***	10 ng/mL	10 µg/mL	-	6.25 µg/mL	10 ng/mL	10 ng/mL	10 ng/mL	-	-	-	-	10	10	10	10	-	-
GnRH(mIU/mL)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	1	-	-	-	-	-	-
FSH(ng/ml)	750 hrFSH	100-500 - 1000	-	100 - ovine FSH	-	750 hrFSH	-	2 (µg/mL)	2.5 µg/mL	2 (µg/mL) oviFSH	2 (µg/mL)	-	100 hrFSH	-	-	2 (µg/mL) Porcine FSH	2** (µg/mL)
LH(µg/mL)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	-	-	-	-	1-2-4-8*	1
Melatonin***	-	-	-	-	1000	-	500	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

14
15
16
17
18
19

20 (pg/mL)																		
21 Leptin	-	-	10	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	-	-	-		
22 (ng/mL)																		
23 Thyroxin	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	1	-	-	-	-	-	1**	
24 (µg/ml)																		
25 E ₂ stradiol-17 β	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5	5	-	-	-	-	-	-	
(ng/ml)																		
26	Growth factors																	
27 GFα (ng/ml)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2.5	2.5
28 EGF (ng/mL)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	10**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
29 GDF-9	100	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	10**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
30 (ng/mL)																		
31 FGF (ng/ml)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	10**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
32 EGF (ng/mL)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	50	50
33 IGF (ng/mL)	-	50	-	50	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
34 linoleic acid	-	-	-	5.35	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
(µg/mL)																		
35 IGF1 (ng/mL)	50	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	10	10	10	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
36	Antioxidants																	
37 Transferrin	5.5	5.5	-	6.25	5.5	5.5	5.5	-	-	-	-	5.5	5.5	5.5	5.5	-	-	-
38 (µg/mL)																		
39 Selenium	5	5	-	6.25	5	5	5	-	-	-	-	5	5	5	5	-	-	-
40 (ng/mL)																		
41 ascorbic acid	50	50	-	50	50	50	50	-	-	-	-	50	50	50	50	-	-	-
42 (µg/mL)																		
43 Gallic acid	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	100	-	-	-	-	-	-
(µM)																		
44 Kaempferol	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	-
45 (µM)																		
46 protocatechui	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	56.25	-	-	-
47 c acid																		
48 (µg/ml)																		

49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

*LH at all concentration induced degeneration of all PFs

**Indicate the best concentration but not necessary combined with other additives

*** shows antioxidant activity

^a Indicate the best MII rate which they were able to achieve.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

837 Figures captions:

838

839 **Fig 1: Schematic sequence of sheep follicular development.**

840

841 **Fig 2: Chromatin configuration during transition from secondary to the EAF stage.**

842

843 NSN pattern, chromatin diffused in the nucleus without any sign of condensation.

844 SN pattern, condensed chromatin surrounded the nucleolus envelop.

845 SNE pattern, the condensed chromatin appeared localized partly around the nucleolus and partly

846 close to the nuclear envelope. Oocytes are stained with the Hoechst 33342 Dye. Scale bar = 10

847 μm .

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

Highlights

1. Limited follicle availability and labor-intensive isolation methods hinder successful in vitro culture.
2. Overcoming diffusion limitations and providing optimal support for EAF growth and architecture are among the challenges of this system.
3. Novel isolation methods, bioengineering technologies, and supplementation with specific substances could be a promising approaches for improving EAF cult





